PHILOSTRATUS

APOLLONIUS OF TYANA

LETTERS OF APOLLONIUS • ANCIENT TESTIMONIA • EUSEBIUS'S REPLY TO HIEROCLES

EDITED AND TRANSLATED BY CHRISTOPHER P. JONES



HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS CAMBRIDGE, MASSACHUSETTS LONDON, ENGLAND 2006

> MCL 2238401 V.3

LETTERS

thology of moral reflections assembled by John Stobaeus in the fifth century, but mainly from a large number of medieval manuscripts. Robert Penella has shown that these form two groups. The first, Penella's Group I, comprises comparatively early manuscripts, the oldest being of the tenth century, while those of Group II are all of the fifteenth or sixteenth. Differences can be marked: for example, Group I gives a version of the first letter that omits about a quarter of the version in Group II. From the first edition of the Letters, that of Bartholomeus Justinopolitanus in 1498, most printed editions have followed the order of Group II, though with various modifications. G. Olearius, whose edition of Philostratus was the standard one for the eighteenth century, and C. L. Kayser, whose edition was similarly standard for much of the nineteenth and twentieth, omitted letters also contained in the Life, and hence these letters are now numbered 42a to 42h and 77a to 77f. Furthermore, all editors have added the twenty or so letters preserved in Stobaeus, using the order in which they appear in his collection and numbering them as 78 to 100.

Besides the complexity of the manuscript tradition, all kinds of question surround the authenticity of the letters, if "authentic" is understood to denote one originally written or dictated by Apollonius, even though later abbreviated or excerpted, as opposed to one wrongly ascribed to him either with intent to deceive or by innocent error. There seems no reason to question Philostratus's statement that the historical Apollonius wrote letters to "kings [which as usually in this period can mean Roman emperors as well as foreign kings], sophists, philosophers, Eleans, Delphians, Indians, and Egyptians, on the subject of gods,

INTRODUCTION

From the rediscovery of writing in Greece in the eighth century, letters formed an integral part of life as well as literature; the only certain example of writing mentioned in Homer is a letter from a Greek king to a ruler of Lycia (Iliad 6.168-169). The earliest known Greek letters, written on lead, are from the sixth century BCE, and in the later fifth century the first historians whose works survive, Herodotus and Thucydides, both incorporate letters into their narratives. The idea that collected letters could be a form of literature can be traced to fourth-century Athens. Sometimes they are due to the writer himself, as in the formal letters of Isocrates, and sometimes apparently to anonymous people interested in the personal and intimate words of great figures such as Plato and Demosthenes. When the authors themselves do not publish their own collections, there is the possibility of more or less serious forgery, sometimes detectable with sophisticated methods of criticism and sometimes not. The supposed letters of the sixth-century tyrant Phalaris were famously unmasked by Richard Bentley, whereas the authenticity of Plato's seventh letter is still disputed.

The letters attributed to Apollonius of Tyana are very heterogeneous both in subject and provenance. They survive partly as quotations in Philostratus's *Life* and in the an-

about customs, morals, and laws, setting upright whatever had been overturned among such people" (VA 1.2.3). It is unlikely that Apollonius made collections of his own letters, as for example the Younger Pliny did of his, but there is no doubt that others did so either before or after his death. According to Philostratus, the emperor Hadrian owned "certain of Apollonius's letters, but not all" (VA 8.20). The biographer cites or alludes to many such letters in the Life, some of which recur in the medieval copies. The biographer's contemporary, namesake, and relative, sometimes called Philostratus of Lemnos, begins a short disquisition on letter-writing with these words: "After the ancients, those who have best considered the epistolary style of discourse are the Tyanean and Dio among philosophers, Brutus, or whoever Brutus used in writing, among generals, and among emperors the divine Marcus in those letters that he wrote himself." This seems to imply that some collection of Apollonius's letters was generally accessible, and later in the third century the neo-Platonist Porphyry (Testimonia 13) quotes one sent by Apollonius to the Indian king Iarchas, unless this is a hazy recollection of a letter cited by Philostratus in the Life (VA 3.51).

The letters preserved in the two groups of manuscripts must be considered separately from those preserved by Stobaeus. In Group II more than in I, some attempts at classification are visible, e.g. Letters 1 to 8 and 14 to 18 are to the Stoic Euphrates, 9 to 10 to Dio of Prusa; in the *Life*, both men appear before Vespasian together with

Life, both men appear before Vespasian together with ¹ Testimonia 8. On Philostratus of Lemnos as the author, F. Solmsen, Pauly-Wissowa 20 (1941) 134.

Apollonius (5.31-37). Letter 11 is addressed to the probouloi (senior magistrates) of Caesarea Maritima in Palestine, 12 and 13 to the same magistrates of Seleuceia Pieria in Syria. When the manuscript letters are considered as a whole, most of them fall into a small number of classes, though with some overlapping. The largest class is of letters addressed to private persons such as Euphrates and Dio; a large subgroup of these consists of the writer's brothers and acquaintances in Tyana (35, 44, 45, 55, 72, 73). Six letters are addressed to Roman emperors, three to Vespasian (42f to 42h), one to Titus (77d) and two to Domitian (20, 21); one is to a "Scythian king," unidentifiable but not necessarily imaginary (28). One, by far the longest in the collection and perhaps not authentic, is a letter of consolation to a proconsul of Asia (58), and a few are admonitory letters addressed to Roman provincial officials of lower rank (30, 31, 54). One is sent to an unnamed "lawgiver," perhaps a specially appointed magistrate in a city of Greece or Asia (29). Several are addressed to groups that may be called "intellectual" or "literary": Platonists (42), "the wise men in the Museum" (34), "those who think themselves wise" (43), "learned authors" (57). Others go to political bodies of various kinds, "leagues" of the "Peloponnesians" (25) and the "Ionians" (71); cities of Greece, Asia, or (in one case) Egypt; or to particular bodies or groups within cities such as the probouloi of Caesarea and Seleuceia (11-13), "the priests at Delphi" (27), "those Ephesians in the sanctuary of Artemis" (65-67). Three are neither by nor to Apollonius: one from a certain Claudius (perhaps not the emperor but some city magistrate) to Tyana "attesting" his excellence as a teacher (53), "Garmos the king of the Babylonians to Neogyndes the king of the

Indians" (59), "King Phraotes to his teacher Iarchas" (77b, probably lifted directly from the Life).

The twenty-three letters preserved by Stobaeus are strikingly different. A few of the addressees overlap with those in the main collection, for example Euphrates, Dio, and Apollonius's brothers (82, 90, 94, 95), but most are persons who appear neither in the other collections nor in the Life, and none can be identified. Almost all these letters are very brief, rarely exceeding a couple of lines. Stobaeus may well have made his choice from the same collection of letters as the one mentioned by Philostratus of Lemnos, but it is impossible to tell whether his letters are more or less authentic than the manuscript ones.

In the search for a "historical" Apollonius behind the hero of Philostratus's biography, the letters have sometimes been invoked as an alternative source of information, and sometimes regarded as more or less fictitious. The best procedure is to judge each on its own merits and without preconceptions.2 It can be argued that some show so detailed a knowledge of contemporary life, and in particular religious customs, that they are unlikely to be forgeries. For example, three letters addressed to the city of Sardis refer to the city's soil "bringing crops" (karpos) for it, to the city as the realm of the goddess Demeter, and to the citizens as "Demeter's own" (56, 75, 75a), allusions that puzzled commentators until in 1998 an inscription revealed that the city had an important cult of Demeter Karpophoros ("Bringer of Crops"). More difficult to judge are those letters that appear to contradict or at least to

amplify the picture given by Philostratus: these might be evidence of his tendency to construct an Apollonius of his own, or they could merely be constructions by other hands. If there are any traits that emerge strongly from the letters and not the *Life*, they are two: first, Apollonius's close contacts with family and friends in Tyana, and his native city in general, and second, his activity as a well-known and widely respected teacher of philosophy. It would not surprise if, in the feverish religious atmosphere of the Severan court, Philostratus had turned a remarkable but not exceptional Pythagorean teacher of the first century into a holy man for a new age.

Unlike the *Life*, the *Letters of Apollonius* have received an excellent modern edition and commentary from Robert Penella (see Bibliography below), on which I have relied for my knowledge of the manuscript and of the authors of conjectures (except for a couple of my own). In all three parts of the volume I have followed the same method of noting deviations from the manuscript tradition as in Volumes I and II of this edition. Deletions are indicated by *del(evit)* followed by the author's name, additions are indicated by angle brackets followed by the author's name, and emendations are indicated by the author's name followed by the reading of all or most of the manuscripts. In the apparatus of the *Letters* I have used the following abbreviations:

Cob. = Cobet

Jon. = the present editor

Kay. = Kayser

Ol. = Olearius

Pen. = Penella

² For a balanced discussion, Penella 23-29.

I have used the following abbreviations in all three parts of this volume:

BT = Bibliotheca Teubneriana

Budé = Collection des Universités de France

CH =Eusebius, $Contra \ Hieroclem$

 $CSEL = Corpus \ Scriptorum \ Christianorum \ Latinorum$

FGrHist = F. Jacoby and others, Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker

GCS = Die Griechischen Christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten Jahrhunderte

LCL = Loeb Classical Library

 $PG = \text{J.-P. Migne}, Patrologiae \ Graecae \ Cursus \ Completus$

PL = J.-P. Migne, Patrologiae Latinae Cursus Completus

SC = Sources Chrétiennes

VA = Philostratus, Vita Apollonii

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Eck, W., "Neues zum Testamentum Dasumii," Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik 30 (1978) 292–295 [on Lr. 58]
- Herrmann, P., "Demeter Karpophoros in Sardeis," *Revue des Etudes Anciennes* 100 (1998) 495–508 [on Lrs. 75 and 75a]
- Jones, C. P., "A Martyria for Apollonius of Tyana," *Chiron* 12 (1982) 137–144 [on Lr. 53]
- Jones, C. P., "Institutions and Cults in the Letters of Apollonius of Tyana," Studi Ellenistici (forthcoming)
- Lo Ĉascio, F., Sulla Autenticità delle Epistole di Apollonio Tianeo, Instituto Siciliano di Studi bizantini e neoellenici, Quaderni 10 (Palermo 1978)

LETTERS

- Norden, E., Agnostos Theos: Untersuchungen zur Formengeschichte religiöser Rede (Leipzig 1913) 337–342 [with contributions by C. Cichorius, on Lr. 58]
- Penella, R. J., The Letters of Apollonius of Tyana: A Critical Text with translation and commentary, Mnemosyne Supplement 56 (Leiden 1979) [indispensable edition and commentary]

Wilamowitz-Moellendorff, U. von, "Lesefrüchte 198 (a)," Hermes 60 (1925) 307–313 = Kleine Schriften 4 (Berlin 1962) 394–401

Έπιστολαὶ Απολλωνίου τοῦ Τυανέως

1. Άπολλώνιος Εὐφράτη. Έμοὶ πρὸς φιλοσόφους έστὶ φιλία, πρὸς μέντοι σοφιστὰς η γραμματιστὰς ή τι τοιούτον γένος έτερον ανθρώπων κακοδαιμόνων ούτε νῦν ἐστι φιλία, μήτε ὕστερόν ποτε γένοιτο. τάδε μεν οὖν οὐ πρὸς σέ, πλὴν εἰ μὴ καὶ σὺ τούτων εἶς, έκεινα δε και πάνυ προς σε θεράπευε σου τὰ πάθη και πειρώ φιλόσοφος είναι καὶ μὴ φθονείν τοῖς ὄντως φιλοσοφούσιν, ἐπεί σοι καὶ γῆρας ήδη πλησίον καὶ θάνατος.

2. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἡ ἀρετὴ φύσει, μαθήσει, [κτήσει]1 χρήσει, δι' ην έκαστον αν είη των προειρημένων ἀποδοχής ἄξιον, σκεπτέον, εί τί σοι τούτων ἐστίν, ή σοφιστείας παυστέον λοιπον ή προικά γε χρηστέον αὐτῆ πρὸς τοὺς ἐντυγχάνοντας, ἐπείπερ ήδη σοι καὶ τὰ Μεγαβύξου.2

3. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἐπῆλθες ἔθνη τὰ μεταξὺ τῆς Ἰταλίας άπο Συρίας άρξάμενος, ἐπιδεικνὺς σεαυτον ἐν ταῖς τοῦ βασιλέως λεγομέναις διπλαῖς. τρίβων δέ σοι

1 [κτήσει] del. Ol. ² Μεγαβύξου Pen.: Μεγαβύζου

LETTERS OF APOLLONIUS OF TYANA

1. To Euphrates: I feel friendship towards philosophers, but towards sophists, teachers of literature, or any other such kind of godforsaken people I neither feel friendship now, nor may I ever do so in future. Now all this is not aimed at you, unless you are one of these people, but the following is very much so: control your emotions, and try to be a philosopher and not to resent real philosophers, since old age and death are already near you.

2. To the same: Virtue comes by nature, learning, and practice, and thanks to virtue all of the aforesaid may deserve approval. Ask yourself whether or not you have any of them, or else give up the sophistic career forthwith, or at least practice it without charging your hearers, seeing that you already have the wealth of Megabyxus.2

3. To the same: You have traveled the provinces as far as Italy starting from Syria, showing yourself off in so-called "king's robes."3 Once you had a cheap cloak, a long white

¹ Stoic philosopher of Tyre (Phoenicia, now Lebanon), and inveterate enemy of Apollonius.

² Persian name implying immense wealth.

 $^{^{\}rm 3}$ Possibly purple garments, for which the wearer required imperial permission.

πότε³ καὶ πώγων λευκὸς καὶ μέγας, πλέον δὲ οὐδέν. εἶτα πῶς διὰ θαλάττης νῦν ὑποστρέφεις, ἄγων φορτίδα μεστὴν ἀργυρίου, χρυσίου, σκευῶν παντοδαπῶν, ἐσθήτων ποικίλων, κόσμου τοῦ λοιποῦ, τύφου καὶ ἀλαζονείας καὶ κακοδαιμονίας; τίς ὁ φόρτος καὶ ὁ τρόπος τῆς καινῆς ἐμπορίας; Ζήνων τραγημάτων ἦν ἔμπορος.

4. τῷ αὐτῷ. 'Ολίγων δεῖ σοῦ τοῖς παισίν, εἰ φιλοσόφου παίδες εἴησαν. ἔδει μὲν οὖν μηδὲ φροντίσαι πλείω σοι γενέσθαι τῶν ἱκανῶν ἄλλως τε καὶ μετὰ ἀδοξίας τινός. ἐπεὶ δὲ ἄπαξ ἐγένετο, δεύτερον ἃν εἴη μεγάλη σπουδῆ νεῖμαί σε τισὶ ἔνια τῶν ὄντων ἔχεις δὲ καὶ πατρίδα καὶ φίλους.

5. τῷ αὐτῷ. Τῶν Ἐπικούρου λόγων ὁ περὶ ἡδονῆς οὐδενὸς ἔτι συνηγόρου δεῖται τῶν ἐκ τοῦ Κήπου καὶ τῆς ἐκείνου διατριβῆς, πέφηνε γὰρ ῶν καὶ κατὰ τὴν Στοὰν ἀληθέστατος. εἰ δὲ ἀντιλέγων προκομιεῖς τὰς Χρυσίππου σχολὰς καὶ δόγματα, γέγραπταί τι καὶ ἐν τοῖς βασιλικοῖς γράμμασιν "Εὐφράτης ἔλαβε" καὶ "πάλιν ἔλαβεν" Ἐπίκουρος δὲ οὐκ ἂν ἔλαβεν.

6. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἡρόμην πλουσίους τινάς, εἰ πικραίνονται. τί δ' οὐ μέλλομεν; ἔφασαν. ἠρόμην οὖν καὶ τὴν αἰτίαν τῆς ἀνάγκης. ἢτιῶντο τὸν πλοῦτον. σὰ δ', ὧ τάλαν, νεόπλουτος.

 3 ποτε Ο
l.: τότε 4 πικραίνονται Καy.: περαίνονται

beard, and nothing more. So how is it that you now return by sea with a boatload of silver, gold, vessels of every kind, embroidered clothing, all kinds of furniture, clothing of various colors, every other sort of adornment, conceit, effrontery, disgrace? What kind of cargo or trafficking does this novel trade involve? Zeno was a merchant in dried fruits.⁴

4. To the same: You do not need much for your children, if only they are the children of a philosopher. You should therefore not even have cared about gaining more than a competence, especially when doing so comes with some disgrace. But now that you have gained one, the next best thing you could do would be to distribute some of your possessions to others as soon as possible, and you have a native city and friends.

5. To the same: Among Epicurus's treatises, On Pleasure no longer needs an advocate from the Garden and his own school, for in the Stoa there has emerged an infallible one.⁵ But if by way of rebuttal you produce Chrysippus's lectures and doctrines,⁶ there is also something written in the imperial accounts: "Payment to Euphrates," "Another payment to Euphrates." There would have been no "Payment to Epicurus."

6. To the same: I asked certain rich men if they felt embittered. "How could we not?" they said. So I asked them what caused this anguish. They blamed their wealth. And you, poor wretch, have just come into wealth.

⁴ Founder of Stoicism, who lived from 335 to 263.

⁵ I. e. Euphrates, though a Stoic, is devoted to the Epicurean ideal of pleasure.

⁶ Chrysippus (ca. 280–207) was a voluminous writer and the first great systematizer of Stoic thought.

7. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἐὰν [ὅτι τάχος]⁵ εἰς Αἰγὰς ἀφίκη καὶ κενώσης ἐκεῖ τὴν ναῦν, ἰτέον ἐστί σοι πάλιν ὅτι τάχος εὶς τὴν Ἰταλίαν καὶ κολακευτέον ὁμοίως νοσοῦντας, γέροντας, γραῦς, ὀρφανούς, πλουσίους, θρυπτομένους, Μίδας, Γέτας. πάντα φασὶ δεῖν τὸν ἔμπορον κάλων σείειν. ἐμοὶ δὲ εἴη τὴν άλίαν τρυπᾶν ἐν Θέμιδος οίκω.

8.1. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἦρά τι καὶ σὰ γράψαιο ἄν; εἰ γὰρ οὕτω γένοιο γενναίος. καὶ ἔχοις δ' ἃν εἰπεῖν τὰ συνήθη ταῦτα καὶ πρόχειρα "λουτρον ἄπαν 'Απολλώνιος παραιτείται." καὶ τῆς οἰκίας οὐδέποτε πρόεισι καὶ σωζομένους έχει τοὺς πόδας. "οὐδὲν ὁρᾶται τῶν τοῦ σώματος κινών." δι' όλου γάρ την ψυχην κινεί. κομά τὴν κεφαλήν." καὶ γὰρ ὁ "Ελλην, ὅτι "Ελλην καὶ οὐ βάρβαρος. "ἐσθῆτα φορεί λινῆν." καὶ τῶν ἱερῶν τὰ καθαρώτατα. "μαντική χρήται." πλείω γὰρ τὰ ἄδηλα, καὶ ἄλλως ἀμήχανον προαισθέσθαι τι τῶν ἐσομένων. "ἀλλ' οὐ πρέπον φιλοσόφω τὸ τοιοῦτον"· ὁ πρέπει καὶ $\theta \epsilon \hat{\omega}$;

8.2. "καὶ σωμάτων δὲ ὀδύνας ἀφαιρεῖ καὶ πάθη παύει" τοῦτό που καὶ πρὸς τὸν ἀσκληπιὸν κοινὸν τὸ έγκλημα. "σιτείται μόνος." οἱ δὲ λοιποὶ ἐσθίουσι. "βραχέα λέγει καὶ ἐπὶ βραχύ." σιγῆσαι γάρ ἐστι

LETTERS

7. To the same: When you have arrived in $Aegeae^7$ and unloaded your ship there, you have to return with all speed to Italy and pay indiscriminate flattery to the sick, to old men, to old women, to orphans, to the wealthy, to effeminates, to every Midas and Getas.8 They say the merchant must go full sail, but for me it is enough to wear out a salt cellar in the house of Justice.9

8.1. To the same: Would you, too, indict me? If only you were honorable enough to do so. You could make these hackneyed, easy charges: "Apollonius avoids every bathing establishment." Yes, and he never emerges from his house, and keeps his feet safe. "You never see him moving any part of his body." Yes, because he keeps his soul in constant motion. "He wears his hair long." And so did the Greek, because he was a Greek and not a barbarian. 10 "He wears linen clothes." Yes, and these are the purest of holy things too. "He practices divination." Yes, because many things are obscure, and otherwise it is impossible to perceive the future. "But such activity is not right for a philosopher." What, when it is right for God?

8.2. "He relieves pains and calms passions." Well, no doubt that charge also applies to Asclepius. "He feeds alone." Well, others eat.11 "He speaks little and briefly." Yes, because he has the power to be silent. "He abstains

^{5 [}ὅτι τάχος] del. Pen.

⁶ γράψαιο Καγ.: γράψαις

⁷ Harbor city of Cilicia in southern Turkey (modern Yumurtalık, previously Ayas).

⁸ Typical slave names.

 $^{{}^{9}}$ I.e. live the simplest possible life compatible with virtue. 10 Probably an allusion to the Spartans at Thermopylae (Herodotus 7.208-209).

 $^{^{11}}$ I.e. (probably), "That does not prevent others from eating."

9. Δίωνι. Αὐλοῖς καὶ λύρα κρεῖττόν ἐστι τέρπειν ἢ λόγω, τὰ μὲν γὰρ ἡδονῆς ὅργανα καὶ μουσικὴ τοὕνομα τῆ τέχνη, λόγος δὲ τὰληθὲς εὐρίσκει. τοῦτό σοι πρακτέον, τοῦτό σοι ῥητέον, ἢν καὶ περὶ τούτου φιλοσοφῆς.

10. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ζητοῦσί τινες τὴν αἰτίαν, δι ἡν πέπαυμαι διαλεγόμενος ἐν πολλοῖς. εἰδέτωσαν οὖν, οἶς ἂν εἰδέναι μέλη τὸ τοιοῦτον ἀδύνατος ἀφελῆσαι λόγος ἄπας, ὃς ἂν εἶς ὢν μὴ καὶ πρὸς ἔνα λέγηται. ὁ τοίνυν ἄλλως διαλεγόμενος δόξης ἥττων ὢν διαλέγοιτ ἄν.

11.1. Καισαρέων προβούλοις. Πρώτον εἰς πάντα θεών ἄνθρωποι δέονται καὶ περὶ παντός, ἔπειτα πόλεων, τιμητέον γὰρ δεύτερον πόλεις μετὰ θεοὺς καὶ τὰ

from all meat and from all animals." That is what makes him a human. If you claim to have filed these charges, Euphrates, perhaps you will add this: "If he was of any account, he would have taken money, gifts, citizenships, as I have." If he was of any account, he would not have taken them. "Still, he would have taken such things for his ancestral city's sake." But it is not an ancestral city if it does not know what it possesses. 13

9. Apollonius to Dio: 14 Soothe with the pipe and the lyre, not with language, for the former are instruments of pleasure, and the art of playing them is called music, whereas language finds the truth. That is what you must practice, that is what you must speak, if truth is your reason for being a philosopher.

10. To the same: Some people look for the reason why I have stopped speaking before large audiences. Well, here is the answer for those who care to know such a thing. Every argument is incapable of helping unless it is singular and addressed to a single person. Therefore one who discourses in any other way presumably does so from love of reputation.

11.1 Apollonius to the councilors of Caesarea: ¹⁵ Above all humans need gods, for every purpose and above every thing, and secondly they need cities, for cities should be honored next after the gods, and every sensible person

for his charm of speech, whence his nickname "Golden-Mouth," *Chrysotomos*. The beginning of this letter is quoted in VA 5.40.

¹⁵ Herod the Great founded Caesarea Maritima on the site of an earlier Greek city, and it retained a strong Greek culture. It later became the capital of the Roman province of Judaea, and Vespasian gave it the status of a Roman colony.

⁷ δύνατος Ol.: ἀδύνατος

 $^{^{12}}$ I.e. animal products such as leather or wool.

¹³ Cities often gave honorary citzenships and other privileges to distinguished philosophers, athletes, and the like. Such honors were regarded as enhancing the repute of the honorand's ancestral city (patris).

¹⁴ Dio Chrysostom, the Stoic philosopher and orator, noted

πόλεως προκριτέον παντὶ νοῦν ἔχοντι. εἰ δὲ μὴ πόλις μόνον εἴη, ἀλλὰ καὶ μεγίστη τῆς Παλαιστίνης, ἀρίστη τε τῶν αὐτόθι μεγέθει καὶ νόμοις καὶ ἐπιτηδεύμασι, καὶ προγόνων κατὰ πόλεμον ἀρεταῖς, ἔτι τε ἤθεσι κατ' εἰρήνην, καθάπερ ἡ ὑμετέρα πόλις, μάλιστα πασῶν τῶν ἄλλων ἐμοί τε⁸ θαυμαστέα τιμητέα τε καὶ ἄλλω δὲ ὁμοίως παντὶ νοῦν ἔχοντι.

11.2. τοῦτο μὲν οὖν ἐκ λόγου κοινοῦ τὸ προκριτικὸν αν εἴη, ⁹ τὸ κατὰ σύγκρισιν τῶν πολλῶν. ὅταν δὲ καὶ ἄρχη πόλις ποτὲ τῆς πρὸς ἔνα τιμῆς ἄνδρα, ποιοῦσα ¹⁰ τοῦτον ἑαυτῆς ξένον καὶ ἄποθεν, τί ἢ τούτου τοῦ ἀνδρὸς πρὸς ἀμοιβὴν ἢ ὑμῶν πρὸς τίσιν ¹¹ ἄξιον εἴη; τοῦτο μόνον ἴσως, εἰ θεοφιλής τις ὢν τύχοι διά τινα φύσεως ἐπιτηδειότητα, τὸ εὕχεσθαι τῆ πόλει τὰ ἀγαθὰ τυγχάνειν τε τῆς εὐχῆς, ὅπερ αν διατελέσαιμι κἀγὼ πράττων ὑπὲρ ὑμῶν, ἐπείπερ ἤσθην ἤθεσιν Ἑλληνικοῖς φαίνουσι τὸ ἴδιον ἀγαθὸν καὶ διὰ γραμμάτων κοινῶν. ᾿Απολλωνίδην δὲ τὸν ᾿Αφροδισίου, νεανίαν ἐρρωμενεστάτης φύσεως ἀξίας τε τοῦ ἡμετέρου ὀνόματος, πειράσομαι χρήσιμον ὑμῖν παρασκευάζειν εἰς ἕκαστα μετὰ καὶ τύχης τινὸς ἀγαθῆς.

12. Σελευκέων τοῖς προβούλοις. Πόλις, ἤτις ἂν οὕτω πρός τε θεοὺς ἔχη καὶ ἀνθρώπων πρὸς τοὺς ἀξίους ἀποδοχῆς, αὐτή τε εὐδαίμων καὶ εἰς ἀρετὴν ἀφέλησε τοὺς μαρτυρηθέντας. ἄρξασθαι μὲν οὖν χά-

must give priority to the affairs of his city. But if it is not just a city, but the greatest one in Palestine, and the best of those there in respect of size, laws, and customs, and in its ancestors' bravery in war and their morals in peacetime as well, as your city is, then I must both admire and honor it above all others, and so also must every other sensible person.

11.2. This then by common consent is the ground for preferring it—the comparison of it with the majority. But whenever a city actually takes the first step to honor a man, making him its own guest even from a distance, what would be a worthy return from such a man or a worthy payment to you? Perhaps only this: if he happens to have the gods' favor because of a certain fitness of character, that he should pray for blessings on the city and have his prayer granted. That I could constantly do for you, since I was delighted by your Greek customs, which reveal your particular excellence by means of your public letter. As for Apollonides the son of Aphrodisius, a young man possessing a very firm nature and one worthy to share my name, I shall try to make him serviceable to you in every respect, with the help of some good fortune.

12. To the councilors of Seleuceia: 16 A city that is disposed as you are towards the gods and towards those men who deserve approval is both fortunate in itself and helps those to whom it testifies to attain virtue. To initiate an act

 $^{^8}$ ἐμοί τε Spengel: ἐμοίγε 9 εἴη Kay.: $\mathring{\eta}$ 10 ποιοῦσα Wilamowitz: πόλις οὖσα καί

 $^{^{16}\ \}mathrm{Probably}$ Seleuceia Pieria, the port city of Antioch. Apollonius visits it in VA 3.58.

¹¹ ύμων πρὸς τίσιν Καγ.: ὑμῖν ἀλλήλοις τισὶν

13. τοῖς αὐτοῖς. Στράτων μὲν ἐξ ἀνθρώπων οἴχεται, πᾶν ὅσον ἢν αὐτῷ θνητὸν ἐπὶ γῆς καταλιπών. χρὴ δὲ τοὺς ἔτι κολαζομένους ἡμᾶς ἐνθάδε, ζῆν ἄλλως λεγομένους, ἔχειν τινὰ τῶν ἐκείνου πραγμάτων ἐπιμέλειαν. ἄλλοις μὲν οὖν ἄλλο τι ἔργον δικαίως γένοιτο νῦν ἢ καὶ ὕστερον, οἶς μὲν ὡς οἰκείοις, οἶς δ' ὡς αὐτὸ μόνον ἀνδράσι φίλοις οὐκ ἐν ἑτέρῳ γνωσθησομένοις χρόνῳ, τούτων εἴπερ ἢν τῶν ὀνομάτων ἀληθές τι καὶ πρόσθεν. ἐγὼ μέντοι καὶ ταύτῃ βουλόμενος ἐξαιρέτως ὑμέτερος εἶναι, τὸν ἐκ Σελευκίδος υίὸν αὐτῷ γενόμενον ᾿Αλέξανδρον αὐτὸς ἀναθρέψω καὶ μεταδώσω παιδείας τῆς ἐμῆς. πάντως δ' ᾶν μετέδωκα καὶ χρημάτων ὁ τὰ μείζονα δούς, εἴπερ ἔχειν ἦν ἄξιον.

14. Εὐφράτη. Πυνθάνονταί μου πολλοὶ πολλάκις, τίνος ἔνεκεν οὐ μετεπέμφθην εἰς Ἰταλίαν, ἢ οὐ μεταπεμφθεὶς ἀφικόμην, ὥσπερ σὺ καὶ εἴ τις ἕτερος. ἐγὼ

of kindness is not hard, but rather the finest of human actions. But to find a proper return is so far from being easy that finding one exactly equivalent to it is impossible, for of course what is second in order can never be first in kind. I am obliged therefore to call upon God on your behalf so that he may reward you, who have proved yourself superior not only potentially but in actual fact as well, for no human can reward such acts. Your wish that I should visit you is in itself a part of your kindness towards me, so that personally I would have prayed to have you as my native city. Your envoys, Hieronymus and Zeno, are all the more estimable for being my friends.

13. To the same persons: Strato has departed the human condition, leaving all that was mortal in him on earth. But we who are still being punished here, or in other words are still alive, should take some care of his affairs. It would therefore be right for each of us to undertake some task either now or later, some of us as his relatives, others simply as his true friends. We will never have another time to prove ourselves to be that, at least if either of those appellations was true in the past. Since, however, I particularly want to help you in the following way too, I shall personally educate Alexander, his son by Seleucis, and impart my knowledge to him. Of course, since I am giving him greater things, I would certainly have given him money too, if it were right for him to have it. 17

14. Apollonius to Euphrates: Many people frequently ask me why I have had no invitation to Italy or, if I have had, why I did not go, like you and anyone else. The first

¹⁷ I.e. if he were not above material considerations.

δὲ περὶ τοῦ προτέρου μὲν οὐκ ἀποκρινοῦμαι, μὴ καὶ δόξω τισὶν εἰδέναι τὴν αἰτίαν, οὐδ' εἰδέναι μοι μέλον, περὶ δὲ τοῦ δευτέρου τί ἃν καὶ δεοίμην ἔτερον λέγειν, ἢ ὅτι μᾶλλον ἃν μετεπέμφθην ἢ ἀφικόμην; ἔρρωσο.

15. τῷ αὐτῷ. Τὴν ἀρετὴν ἀδέσποτον εἶναι Πλάτων ἔφησεν. εἰ δὲ μὴ τιμᾳ τοῦτό τις καὶ γέγηθεν ἐπ' αὐτῷ, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὥνιος γίνεται χρημάτων, πολλοὺς δεσπότας ἑαυτοῦ ποιεῖ.

16. τῷ αὐτῷ. Μάγους οἴει δεῖν ὀνομάζειν τοὺς ἀπὸ Πυθαγόρου φιλοσόφους, ὧδέ που καὶ τοὺς ἀπὸ 'Ορ-φέως. ἐγὼ δὲ καὶ τοὺς ἀπὸ τοῦ Διὸς οἶμαι δεῖν ὀνομάζεσθαι μάγους, εἰ μέλλουσιν εἶναι θεῖοί τε καὶ δίκαιοι.

17. τῷ αὐτῷ. Μάγους ὀνομάζουσι τοὺς θείους 12 οἱ Πέρσαι. μάγος οὖν ὁ θεραπευτὴς τῶν θεῶν ἢ ὁ τὴν φύσιν θεῖος, σὰ δ' οὐ μάγος, ἀλλ' ἄθεος.

18. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἡράκλειτος ὁ φυσικὸς ἄλογον εἶναι κατὰ φύσιν ἔφησε τὸν ἄνθρωπον. εἶ δὲ τοῦτο ἀληθές, ὤσπερ ἐστὶν ἀληθές, ἐγκαλυπτέος ἕκαστος ὁ ματαίως ἐν δόξη γενόμενος.

19. Σκοπελιανῷ σοφιστῆ. Πέντε εἰσὶ σύμπαντες οἱ τοῦ λόγου χαρακτῆρες, ὁ φιλόσοφος, ὁ ἰστορικός, ὁ δικανικός, ὁ ἐπιστολικός, ὁ ὑπομνηματικός. ἐγκειμένων δὴ τῶν γενικῶν χαρακτήρων τῆ τάξει, πάλιν

question I myself will not answer, so that no one may think I know the reason, when I do not even care to. As to the second question, however, what need I say other than that I would rather have been invited than have arrived? Good bye.

15. To the same: Plato said that virtue has no master. ¹⁸ If a person does not honor this principle and rejoice in it, but is purchasable for money, he creates many masters for himself.

16. To the same person: You think that you should call philosophers who follow Pythagoras Magi, and similarly, no doubt, those who follow Orpheus. But I think that even those who follow Zeus should be called Magi, if they plan to be godly and righteous. ¹⁹

17. To the same: The Persians call godly men Magi, so that one who worships the gods or has a godly nature is a sorcerer. But you are not a sorcerer, but an atheist.

18. To the same: The natural philosopher Heracleitus said that man is naturally irrational. If this is true, as it is true, then everyone who enjoys futile glory should hide his face.

face.
19. Apollonius to Scopelian the sophist:20 The categories of speech are five in all: the philosophical, the historical, the forensic, the epistolary, and the bureaucratic. Now when these formal styles are ranked, in fact the first proves

19 The Magi were a Persian clan responsible for upholding religion, but the Greeks identified them with "magicians" or wonder-workers. Like Pythagoreans, devotees of Orpheus were supposed to dabble in the supernatural.

20 Noted sophist of the late first century CE, cf. VA 1.23.3.

¹² θείους Καγ.: θεούς

¹⁸ Republic X 617 E.

γίνεται πρώτος μὲν ὁ κατὰ τὴν ἐκάστου δύναμιν ἢ φύσιν ἴδιος ὤν, δεύτερος δὲ ὁ ἐν μιμήσει τοῦ ἀρίστου, τῶν ἐκ φύσεως εἴ τις ἐνδεὴς εἴη. τὸ δὲ ἄριστον δυσεύρετόν τε καὶ δυσεπίκριτον, ὤστε οἰκειότερος ἑκάστῳ χαρακτὴρ ὁ ἴδιος, ἐπείπερ καὶ βεβαιότερος.

20. Δομετιανῷ. Εἴ σοι δύναμίς ἐστιν, ἄσπερ ἐστίν, καὶ φρόνησιν ἃν εἴη σοι κτητέον καὶ γὰρ εἰ φρόνησις ἢν, δύναμις δὲ ἀπῆν, ὁμοίως ἔδει σοι δυνάμεως. δεῖται γὰρ ἀεὶ τὸ ἔτερον τοῦ ἐτέρου, ὥσπερ ὄψις φωτὸς καὶ φῶς ὄψεως.

21. τῷ αὐτῷ. Βαρβάρων ἀφεκτέον καὶ οὐκ ἀρκτέον αὐτῶν. οὐ γὰρ θέμις αὐτοὺς βαρβάρους ὄντας εὖ πάσχειν.

22. Λεσβώνακτι. Δεῖ πένεσθαι μὲν ὡς ἄνδρα, πλουτεῖν δὲ ὡς ἄνθρωπον.

23. Κρίτωνι. Τὸ θειότατον Πυθαγόρας ἰατρικὴν ἔφασκεν. εἰ δὲ ἰατρικὴ τὸ θειότατον, καὶ ψυχῆς ἐπιμελητέον μετὰ σώματος, ἢ τὸ ζῷον οὐκ ἂν ὑγιαίνοι τῷ κρείττονι νοσοῦν.

24. Έλλανοδίκαις καὶ Ἡλείοις. Ἁξιοῦτέ με τῷ ἀγῶνι τῶν Ἡλυμπίων παραγενέσθαι καὶ διὰ τοῦτο ἐπέμψατε πρέσβεις. ἐγὼ δὲ παρεγενόμην ἂν ἐπὶ σωμάτων θέαν καὶ ἄμιλλαν, εἰ μὴ τὸν μείζονα τῆς ἀρετῆς ἀγῶνα καταλείψειν ἔμελλον. to be the one proper to each person by reason of his abilities or nature, and the second is the one consisting in imitation of the best, if someone happens to be deficient in the gifts of nature. The best, however, is difficult to find and to determine, so that it is the personal style that is the more appropriate to each person, being also the more consistent.

20. Apollonius to Domitian: If you have power, as in fact you do, you should perhaps also acquire foresight. For, you see, if you had foresight but no power, even so you would need power. For each of these always needs the other, just as sight needs light and light needs sight.

21. To the same: You must shun barbarians and not govern them since, barbarians as they are, it is not right that they should receive a benefit.²¹

22. To Lesbonax:²² One should bear poverty like a man, and wealth like a human being.

23. To Crito:²³ Pythagoras said that medicine is the most godlike of arts. But if the most godlike, it should tend to the soul as well as the body, or else a living thing must be unhealthy, being diseased in its higher part.

24. To the Judges of the Hellenes²⁴ and the Eleans: You request my presence at the Olympic Games, and for that reason you have sent envoys. For myself, I would come for the spectacle of physical struggle, except that I would be abandoning the greater struggle for virtue.

 $^{^{21}}$ Philostratus makes Apollonius express a similar view about barbarians to Domitian in his speech of defense, VA 8.7.25.

²² Unknown, also addressed in Letter 61. The name Lesbonax recurs in a prominent family of Mytilene.

²³ T. Statilius Crito, celebrated physician of the reigns of Domitian and Trajan.

²⁴ Umpires of the Olympic Games: cf. VA 3.30.2.

25. Πελοποννησίοις. 'Ολύμπια τὸ δεύτερον, καὶ τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ἐγένεσθε πολέμιοι, τὸ δεύτερον δὲ οὐ φίλοι.

26. τοις ἐν 'Ολυμπία θεηκόλοις. 13 Θεοι θυσιῶν οὐ δέονται. τί οὖν ἄν τις πράττων χαρίζοιτο αὐτοις; φρόνησιν, ὡς ἐμοι δοκεῖ, κτώμενος ἀνθρώπων τε τοὺς ἀξίους εἰς δύναμιν εὖ ποιῶν. ταῦτα φίλα θεοις, ἐκεινα δὲ ἀθέων.

27. τοις ἐν Δελφοις ιερεῦσιν. Αἴματι βωμοὺς μιαίνουσιν ιερεῖς, εἶτα θαυμάζουσί τινες, πόθεν αἱ πόλεις ἀτυχοῦσιν, ὅταν μεγάλα δυστυχήσωσιν. ὢ τῆς ἀμαθίας. Ἡράκλειτος ἦν σοφός, ἀλλ' οὐδὲ ἐκεῖνος Ἐφεσίους ἔπεισε μὴ πηλῷ πηλὸν καθαίρεσθαι.

28. βασιλεί Σκυθών. Ζάμολξις ἀνὴρ ἀγαθὸς ἦν καὶ φιλόσοφος, εἴ γε μαθητὴς Πυθαγόρου ἐγένετο, καὶ εἰ κατ' ἐκεῖνον τὸν χρόνον τοιοῦτος ἦν ὁ 'Ρωμαῖος, ἑκὼν ἃν ἐγένετο φίλος. εἰ δὲ ὑπὲρ ἐλευθερίας οἴει δεῖν ἀγῶνα καὶ πόνον ἔχειν, ἄκουε φιλόσοφος, τουτέστιν ἐλεύθερος.

13 θεηκόλοις Καγ.: θεηκόροις

LETTERS

25. To the Peloponnesians:²⁵ The Olympics are here again. The first time around, you behaved as enemies, and the second time around, not as friends.²⁶

26. To the cult personnel²⁷ of Olympia: The gods do not need sacrifices, so what might one do to please them? Acquire wisdom, it seems to me, and do all the good in one's power to those humans who deserve it. That is what pleases the gods, but your actions are those of atheists.²⁸

27. To the priests at Delphi:²⁹ Priests pollute altars with blood, and then some people wonder why their cities are unfortunate when they suffer great misfortune. What ignorance! Heraclitus was wise, but not even he could dissuade the Ephesians from cleaning mud with mud.³⁰

28. To the king of the Scythians:³¹ Zamolxis was a good man and a philosopher, if he was a pupil of Pythagoras.³² And if in those days the Roman had been similar, Zamolxis would have willingly been his friend. But if you suppose you must endure struggle and pain for the sake of freedom, make yourself known as a philosopher, that is a free man.

them seems to be blood-sacrifice, the subject of the next two letters. For his abhorrence of blood sacrifice, VA 1.10, 1.31.2, etc.

28 Probably a reference to blood sacrifice.

29 Delphic Apollo had two priests who served for life.

30 Le. from using blood sacrifice in order to wash away blood pollution.

31 "Scythians" was a general term for peoples north of the Black Sea, especially in the Crimea. The Romans fought many campaigns against them, and this may be some local king defending the freedom of his realm.

32 Zamolxis was a Scythian divinity who, according to a Greek tradition, had once been a slave of Pythagoras (Herodotus 4.95).

 $^{^{\}rm 25}$ Probably a league or confederation of cities of the Peloponnese.

²⁶ Meaning obscure, but probably a reference to faction between cities. During the Olympics it was customary to observe a sacred truce (*echecheiria*).

²⁷ Theēkoloi, a type of priest mainly associated with the cult of Olympian Zeus. The practice against which Apollonius warns

29. νομοθέτη. Αἱ ἑορταὶ νόσων αἰτίαι, τοὺς μὲν γὰρ πόνους ἀνιᾶσι, τὸ ἐμπίπλασθαι δὲ αὕξουσιν.

30. ταμίαις 'Ρωμαίων. 'Αρχὴν ἄρχετε πρώτην. εἰ μὲν οὖν ἄρχειν ἐπίστασθε, διὰ τί τὸ παρ' ὑμᾶς χεῖρον ἑαυτῶν αἱ πόλεις ἔχουσιν; εἰ δὲ οὐκ ἐπίστασθε, μαθεῖν ἔδει πρῶτον, εἶτα ἄρχειν.

31. διοικηταις 'Ασίας. Τι ὄφελος ἀγρίων δένδρων φυομένων ἐπὶ βλάβη τοὺς κλάδους κόπτειν, ἐᾶν δὲ τὰς ρίζας:

32. Ἐφεσίων γραμματεῦσιν. Λίθων ἐν πόλει, καὶ γραφῶν ποικίλων, καὶ περιπάτων, καὶ θεάτρων, οὐδὲν ὄφελος, εἰ μὴ νοῦς ἐνείη καὶ νόμος. νοῦς δὲ καὶ νόμος περὶ τούτων ἐστίν, οὐ ταῦτα.

33. Μιλησίοις. Οἱ παῖδες ὑμῶν πατέρων δέονται, οἱ νέοι γερόντων, αἱ γυναῖκες ἀνδρῶν, οἱ ἄνδρες ἀρχόντων, οἱ ἄρχοντες νόμων, οἱ νόμοι φιλοσόφων, οἱ φιλόσοφοι θεῶν, οἱ θεοὶ πίστεως. προγόνων ἀγαθῶν ἐστε, τὰ παρόντα μισεῖτε.

34. τοῖς ἐν Μουσείῳ σοφοῖς. Ἐγενόμην ἐν Ἄργει καὶ Φωκίδι καὶ Λοκρίδι καὶ ἐν Σικυῶνι καὶ ἐν Μεγάροις, καὶ διαλεγόμενος τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν χρόνοις ἐπαυσάμην ἐκεῖ. τί οὖν, εἴ τις ἔροιτο, τὸ αἴτιον; ἐγὰ φράσαιμ' ἂν ὑμῖν τε καὶ Μούσαις· "ἐβαρβαρώθην" οὐ

29. To a lawgiver:³³ Festivals cause diseases, since they lighten cares but increase gluttony.

30. To the Roman quaestors:³⁴ You are holding your first office. Well, if you know how to hold office, how is it that thanks to you the cities are worse off than ever? But if you do not know, you should have learned first and held office later.

31. To the procurators of Asia:³⁵ What is the point, when wild trees are causing damage by their growth, of cutting back the branches and leaving the roots?

32. To the scribes of the Ephesians:³⁶ Multicolored stones and paintings, walkways, and theaters are useless in a city unless it also contains wisdom and law. Such things are the subject of wisdom and law, not equivalent to them.

33. To the Milesians: Your sons need fathers, your young men elders, your women men, your men magistrates, your magistrates laws, your laws philosophers, your philosophers gods, your gods belief. You have fine ancestors, but you detest your present circumstances.

34. To the wise men in the Museum:³⁷ I have visited Argos, Phocis, Locris, Sicyon, and Megara, and though I used to lecture in former days, I stopped doing so there. What is the reason, someone might ask? I may tell both you and the Muses: "Barbarian have I become," not "by long

 $^{^{33}}$ In Greek cities of the imperial period, a "lawgiver" (nomothet $\bar{e}s$) was sometimes appointed to revise the laws.

³⁴ The quaestorship gave entry to the Roman senate, and each year a quaestor was assigned to each of the "public" or "senatorial" provinces of the Empire to assist the proconsul.

³⁵ Roman officials chiefly concerned with the collection of provincial taxes.

³⁶ Magistrates of Ephesus, cf. Acts 19.35. Ephesus was one of the most prosperous cities of Asia.

³⁷ There were several "Museums," sanctuaries of the Muses to which learned men were attached, but this is probably the famous one in Alexandria.

"χρόνιος ὢν ἀφ' Ἑλλάδος," ἀλλὰ χρόνιος ὢν ἐν Ἑλλάδι.

35. Έστιαίφ. 'Αρετὴ καὶ χρήματα παρ' ἡμῖν ἀλλήλοις ἐναντιώτατα, μειούμενον γὰρ τὸ ἔτερον αὕξει τὸ
ἔτερον, αὐξανόμενον δὲ μειοῖ. πῶς οὖν δυνατὸν ἀμφότερα περὶ τὸν αὐτὸν γενέσθαι; πλὴν εἰ μὴ τῷ τῶν
ἀνοήτων λόγφ, παρ' οἶς καὶ ὁ πλοῦτος ἀρετή. μὴ δὴ
τοσοῦτον ἡμῶν ἀναισθητεῖν ἐπίτρεπε τοῖς αὐτόθι,
μηδὲ ἔα πλουσίους ἡμᾶς ὑπολαμβάνειν μᾶλλον ἢ
φιλοσόφους. καὶ γὰρ αἴσχιστον ἀποδημεῖν ἡμᾶς διὰ
χρήματα δοκεῖν, ἐνίων, ἵνα μνήμην ἑαυτῶν καταλίπωσι, μηδὲ ἀρετὴν ἀσπασαμένων.

36. Κορινθίφ Βάσσφ. Ἦν Πραξιτέλης Χαλκιδεύς μαινόμενος ἄνθρωπος. οὖτος ἦλθέ ποτε ξιφήρης ἐπὶ θύρας τὰς ἐμὰς ὑπὸ σοῦ σταλεὶς τοῦ φιλοσόφου καὶ ἀγωνοθέτου τῶν Ἰσθμίων. τοῦ φόνου δ' ἦν μισθὸς δεδομένος ἡ τῆς γυναικός σου κοινωνία, καί, μιαρὲ Βάσσε, πολλάκις εὐεργέτης ἐγενόμην σου.

37. τῷ αὐτῷ. Εἰ πυνθάνοιτο Κορινθίων τις, πῶς ὁ Βάσσου πατὴρ ἀπέθανεν, ἐροῦσιν ἄπαντες οἱ ἀστικοὶ καὶ οἱ μέτοικοι "φαρμάκῳ." τίνος δόντος; ἐροῦσι καὶ οἱ ὅμοροι "τοῦ φιλοσόφου." καὶ ὁ μιαρὸς τῷ πτώματι τοῦ πατρὸς ἑπόμενος ἔκλαιεν.

absence from Greece,"38 but by long presence in Greece.

35. To Hestiaeus:³⁹ In my judgement excellence and wealth are direct opposites, since when the one shrinks the other grows, and when one grows the other shrinks. How then is it possible for both to be found in the same person, except by the reasoning of fools, who equate wealth with excellence? Do not allow people there⁴⁰ to form such a wrong impression of me, or let them suppose that I am a wealthy man rather than a lover of wisdom. It would indeed be a disgrace that I should seem to remain abroad for the sake of money, when some people who wish to leave a memorial of themselves have not even embraced virtue.⁴¹

36. Apollonius to Bassus the Corinthian:⁴² Praxiteles of Chalcis⁴³ was a man demented. This man once came to my door armed with a sword, sent by you, a philosopher and president of the Isthmian Games. The reward given for my murder was intercourse with your wife, even though I have often done you favors, you scoundrel Bassus!

37. To the same: If anyone should ask the Corinthians how Bassus's father died, one and all will say, whether natives or aliens, "By poison." And if anyone should ask by whose hand, even the people in the neighboring cities will answer, "The philosopher's." And yet that scoundrel wept as he followed his father's corpse.

LETTERS

 ⁴¹ I.e., Apollonius is traveling not to make money, but to promote virtue, whereas some who spend money in order to be remembered by their fellow citizens neither travel nor pursue virtue.
 42 Ally of Apollonius's enemy Euphrates, cf. VA
 4.26.
 43 Mentioned again in Letters 60 and 77, but otherwise unknown. Chalcis is presumably the most important city of that name, on Euboea.

³⁸ Adapted from Euripides, Orestes 485.

³⁹ Apollonius's brother, recipient of several letters, and presumably the unnamed elder brother of VA 1.13.

⁴⁰ Tyana.

39. τοις αὐτοις. Αἰσχρὰ καὶ τὰ ὀνόματα τῶν ταγμάτων ὑμῶν· Κόδδαροι, Ξυρισίταυροι. ταῦτα τοις τέκνοις τίθεσθε τὰ πρῶτα, καὶ εὕχεσθε¹⁴ γίνεσθαι τούτων ἄξιοι.

40. τοῖς αὐτοῖς. Κόδδαροι καὶ Ξυρισίταυροι. Τὰς δὲ θυγατέρας ὑμῶν καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας πῶς ἂν προσαγορεύοιτε; τῶν γὰρ αὐτῶν ταγμάτων εἰσὶ καὶ αὖται καὶ θρασύτεραι.

41. τοις αὐτοις. Οὐδὲ τοὺς οἰκέτας ὑμιν εὐνοειν εἰκός, πρῶτον μὲν ὅτι οἰκέται, εἶθ' ὅτι τῶν ἐναντίων ταγμάτων οἱ πλειστοι. κἀκεινοι γὰρ ὁμοίως ὑμιν ἀπὸ γένους.

42. Πλατωνικοῖς. Ἐάν τις ἀπολλωνίω χρήματα διδώ, καὶ ὁ διδοὺς ἄξιος νομίζηται, λήψεται δεόμενος. φιλοσοφίας δὲ μισθὸν οὐ λήψεται, κἂν δέηται.

42a. Ἀπολλώνιος ἐφόροις χαίρειν. Ἀνδρῶν μὲν τὸ μὴ ἀμαρτάνειν, γενναίων δὲ τὸ ἁμαρτάνοντας αἰσθέσθαι.

38. To those in Sardis:⁴⁴ You have no first prize for goodness, for what kind of goodness do you have? But if you win first place for wickedness, you do so in a dead heat. Who will say this about those in Sardis? Those in Sardis will. For no one there is so well disposed to his neighbor as to deny his wickednesses out of goodwill.

39. To the same: Even the names of your clubs are disgraceful—"Koddaroi," "Bull-Shavers." These are the first names that you give to your children, and you pray for them to prove worthy of such names.

40. To the same: "Koddaroi" and "Bull-Shavers." And your daughters and your wives—what will you call them? For they join the same clubs, and are even more shameless than you are.

41. To the same persons: Not even your servants can be expected to feel kindly towards you, first because they are servants, and second because most of them belong to the opposing clubs. For they, like you, have their ancestors.

42. Apollonius to the Platonists: If someone gives money to Apollonius, and the giver is someone considered respectable, he will take the money if he needs it. But he will not accept a fee for philosophy even if he does need it.

42a. 46 To the ephors: It is the mark of true men not to err, and of noble ones to realize their errors.

¹⁴ εὔχεσθε Καy.: εὐτυχεῖτε

⁴⁴ No less than eight of the letters concern civil strife in Sardis. There is evidence for an especially strong outbreak of this under Domitian.

⁴⁵ "Koddaroi" is unexplained, but "Bull-Shavers" probably means "those who shave their genital hair."

⁴⁶ This letter also appears in VA 4.27.

42b. ᾿Απολλώνιος Μουσωνίω φιλοσόφω χαίρειν. βούλομαι παρὰ σὲ ἀφικόμενος κοινωνῆσαί σοι λόγου καὶ στέγης, ὥς τι ὀνήσαιμί σε, εἴ γε μὴ ἀπιστεῖς ὡς Ἡρακλῆς ποτε Θησέα ἐξ Ἅιδου ἔλυσε. γράφε, τί βούλει. ἔρρωσο.

42c. Μουσώνιος 'Απολλωνίω φιλοσόφω χαίρειν. ὧν μὲν ἐνενοήθης ἀποκείσεταί σοι ἔπαινος, ἀνὴρ δὲ ὁ ὑπομείνας ἀπολογίαν καὶ ὡς οὐδὲν ἀδικεῖ δείξας ἑαυτὸν λύει. ἔρρωσο.

42d. 'Απολλώνιος Μουσωνίφ φιλοσόφφ χαίρειν. Σωκράτης 'Αθηναίος ὑπὸ τῶν ἐαυτοῦ φίλων λυθῆναι μὴ βουληθεὶς παρῆλθε μὲν ἐς δικαστήριον, ἀπέθανε δέ.

42e. Μουσώνιος 'Απολλωνίφ φιλοσόφφ χαίρειν. Σωκράτης ἀπέθανεν, 'ἐπεὶ μὴ παρεσκεύασεν ἐς ἀπολογίαν ἑαυτόν, ἐγὼ δὲ ἀπολογήσομαι.

42f. 'Απολλώνιος Οὐεσπασιανῷ. 'Εδουλώσω¹⁵ τὴν Έλλάδα, ὥς φασι, καὶ πλέον μὲν οἴει τι ἔχειν Ξέρξου, λέληθας δὲ ἔλαττον ἔχων Νέρωνος· Νέρων γὰρ ἔχων αὐτὸ παρητήσατο. ἔρρωσο.

42g. τῷ αὐτῷ. Διαβεβλημένος οὕτω πρὸς Ἑλληνας ώς δουλοῦσθαι αὐτοὺς ἐλευθέρους ὄντας, τί ἐμοῦ ξυν-όντος δέη; ἔρρωσο.

42h. τῷ αὐτῷ. Νέρων τοὺς ελληνας παίζων ἠλευθέρωσε, σὺ δὲ αὐτοὺς σπουδάζων ἐδουλώσω. ἔρρωσο.

43. τοῖς οἰησισόφοις. 16 Εἰ λέγει τις εἶναι γνώριμος ἐμός, λεγέτω καὶ μένειν ἔνδον, ἀπέχεσθαι λουτροῦ

LETTERS

42b.⁴⁷ Apollonius to Musonius:⁴⁸ I wish to come to you and share your conversation and your roof so as to help you, at least if you admit that Heracles once liberated Theseus from Hades. Write and tell me your wish. Goodbye.

42c. Musonius to Apollonius: Praise awaits you for your intentions. But a true man who undertakes his defense and proves his innocence is his own liberator. Goodbye.

42d. Apollonius to Musonius: Socrates of Athens preferred not to be liberated by his friends, and so came to trial, but died.

42e. Musonius to Apollonius: Socrates died because he was not prepared to defend himself, but I will defend myself.

42f. Apollonius to Vespasian:⁴⁹ Apollonius greets the emperor Vespasian. You have enslaved Greece, I am told. You think you possess more than Xerxes did, but without realizing it you possess less than Nero did. Nero both had it and refused it. Goodbye.

42g. To the same: If you think so ill of the Greeks as to make them slaves when they are free, why do you need my presence? Goodbye.

42h. To the same: Nero freed the Greeks in play, but you have enslaved them in earnest. Goodbye.

43. To those who think themselves wise: If anyone claims to be my pupil, let him also claim that he remains

⁴⁷ Letters 42b-e also appear in VA 4.46.2-5.

⁴⁸ Celebrated Stoic philosopher, cf. VA 4.35, 5.19.2.

⁴⁹ Letters 42f-h also appear in VA 5.41.2-4.

¹⁵ ἐδουλώσω Pen. (e VA 5.41.2): ἐδουλώσας

¹⁶ οἰησισόφοις Kay.: οἰησόφοις

παντός, ζῷα μὴ κτείνειν, μηδὲ ἔδειν σάρκας, ἀπαθὴς εἶναι φθόνου κακοηθείας μίσους διαβολῆς ἔχθρας, τοῦ τῶν ἐλευθέρων ὀνομάζεσθαι γένους, ἡ φυλακτέος πλάσματα φέρων τρόπου τε καὶ ἤθους καὶ λόγων ψευδῶν ἀλλοτρίου βίου πίστιν.

44.1. Έστιαίφ τῷ ἀδελφῷ. Τί θαυμαστόν, εἴ με τῶν ἄλλων ἀνθρώπων ἰσόθεον ἡγουμένων, τινῶν δὲ καὶ θεόν, μόνη μέχρι νῦν ἡ πατρὶς ἀγνοεῖ, δι' ἡν ἐξαιρέτως ἐσπούδασα λαμπρὸς εἶναι; τουτὶ γὰρ οὐδ' ὑμῖν τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς, ὡς ὁρῶ, γέγονε φανερόν, ὡς εἰμι ἀμείνων πολλῶν λόγους τε καὶ ἢθος. ἐπεὶ πῶς ἄν μου κατεγινώσκετε χαλεπὴν κατάγνωσιν ‹ὡς >17 ὑπομνήσεως τὴν ἀρχὴν δεομένου, 18 περὶ ὧν μόνων οὐδὲ τῶν ἀμαθεστάτων ἄν τις περιμείνειε διδαχθῆναι; λέγω δὲ πατρίδος τε καὶ ἀδελφῶν.

44.2. καίτοι οὐ λέληθεν ὑμᾶς, ὡς καλῶς ἔχον ἐστὶ πᾶσάν τε γῆν πατρίδα νομίζειν καὶ πάντας ἀνθρώπους ἀδελφοὺς καὶ φίλους, ὡς ἃν γένος μὲν ὄντας θεοῦ, μιᾶς δὲ φύσεως, κοινωνίας δ' οὔσης λόγου τε παντὶ καὶ πᾶσι ‹καὶ›¹٩ παθῶν τῆς αὐτῆς, ὅπῃ γε καὶ ὅπως ἄν τις τύχῃ γενόμενος, εἴτε δὴ βάρβαρος, εἴτε καὶ Ἔλλην, ἄλλως τε καὶ ἄνθρωπος. ἀλλὶ ἔστι γάρ πως τὸ συγγενὲς ἀκατασόφιστον καὶ πᾶν ἀνακλητικὸν αὐτοῦ τὸ οἰκεῖον. οὕτως ὁ 'Ομηρικὸς 'Οδυσσεύς,

indoors, avoids all bathing, does not kill animals or eat their flesh, is free from envy, malignity, hatred, scandalmongering, and hostility, and is considered to belong to the class of free men. Otherwise he must be shunned as using the mask of nature, character, and fake doctrines as evidence for a life that is not his own.

44.1. To Hestiaeus, his brother: Why is it surprising that most of humanity thinks me close to a god, and some an actual god, 50 and yet up to now only my ancestral city fails to recognize me, when it is for her that I have particularly striven to distinguish myself? No, because not even to you, my brothers, so I see, has it become clear that I am superior to most people in principles and character. Otherwise how could you condemn me so severely as to suppose I needed reminding at all about the one class of matters on which not even the greatest fool could bear being instructed? That is, about one's city and brothers.

44.2. And yet you are well aware that it is an honorable thing to regard the whole earth as one's ancestral city and all humans as his brothers and friends, since we are all akin to God, have a single nature, and have the same community of thought and emotions with each and every person, wherever and however we may have come into existence, whether barbarian or Greek, so long as we are human. No, kinship cannot be argued away, and everything that is akin responds to its own kind. Hence Homer's Odysseus, so

LETTERS

⁵⁰ In the *Life*, various people "reverence" Apollonius (*proskunein*) or consider him "godlike" (*theios*), but he is not regarded as a god.

^{17 (}ώς > Kay.

¹⁸ δεομένου Καγ.: δεομένων

^{19 (}Kai) Kay.

ως φασιν, οὐδὲ ἀθανασίαν ὑπὸ θεᾶς διδομένην 'Ιθάκης προὐτίμησεν.

44.3. ὁρῶ δ' ἔγωγε τὸν νόμον τόνδε καὶ διὰ τῶν ἀλόγων ζώων πεφοιτηκότα. οὐ γάρ, ὁπόσον πτηνόν, καλιῶν ἀπόκοιτον ἰδίων, πᾶν τε βύθιον παρασύρεται μὲν ὑπὸ τοῦ φέροντος, ἐπάνεισι δὲ μὴ νικηθέν, θηρία μὲν γὰρ οὕτε λιμὸς οὕτε κόρος ἔπεισεν ἔξω φωλεῶν μεῖναι. ἔνα²ο τούτων ἡ φύσις ἤνεγκεν ἄνθρωπον καὶ ταῦτα σοφὸν λεγόμενον, ῷ κἂν πάντα τὰ λοιπὰ γῆ πᾶσα παρέχη, μνήματα οὐκ ἔχει δεῖξαι τὰ πατέρων.

45. τῷ αὐτῷ. εἰ τῶν ὄντων τὸ τιμιώτατον φιλοσοφία, πεπιστεύμεθα δ' ἡμεῖς φιλοσοφεῖν, οὐκ ἄν ὀρθῶς ὑπολαμβανοίμεθα μισάδελφοι, καὶ ταῦτα δι αἰτίαν ἀγεννῆ τε ἄμα καὶ ἀνελεύθερον. χρημάτων γὰρ δήπου χάριν ἡ ὑποψία, τούτων δὲ καὶ πρὶν ἢ φιλοσοφεῖν ἐπειρώμεθα καταφρονεῖν, ὥστε τοῦ μὴ γράφειν εὐλογώτερον ἂν εἴη πρόφασιν ἐτέραν ὑπονοεῖν. ἐφυλαττόμην γὰρ ἀληθῆ μὲν γράφων ἀλαζὼν δοκεῖν, ψευδῆ δὲ ταπεινός, ὧν ἑκάτερον ἐπίσης ἀνιαρὸν ἀδελφοῖς τε καὶ φίλῳ παντί. νυνὶ μέντοι καὶ τοῦτο δηλῶ (συγχωροίη γὰρ ᾶν ἴσως τὸ δαιμόνιον) ὅτι συμβαλὼν τοῖς ἐν Ῥόδῳ φίλοις μετ' ὀλίγον ἐκεῦθεν ἐπάνειμι πρὸς ὑμᾶς λήγοντος ἔαρος.

46. Γορδίω. Ἡδικῆσθαί φασιν Ἑστιαῖον ὑπὸ σοῦ

20 ἔνα Pen.: τίνα

they say, did not even value the immortality given to him by a goddess more than he valued Ithaca.

44.3. I myself observe that this law has gained currency among irrational animals too. For no winged creature sleeps away from its own nest; every creature of the deep may be carried by the current, but returns if not swept away; and wild beasts are induced by neither hunger nor satiety to stay away from their dens. One such creature brought forth by nature is man, who is called "wise" too, and yet even if the whole earth supplies him with everything else, it cannot show him the tombs of his ancestors.⁵¹

45. To the same: If philosophy is the most valuable thing in existence, and I am considered a philosopher, I could not properly be supposed to hate my brothers, especially not for an ignoble and mean reason. For clearly money is the cause of this suspicion, and yet I tried to despise it even before becoming a philosopher, so that it would be more logical to suspect another reason for my not writing. I was anxious not to seem boastful by writing the truth, and not to seem meek by writing falsehood, since to be either is equally vexatious both to brothers and to every friend. Now however I can announce this, and perhaps the powers above will allow it: after meeting with my friends in Rhodes, 52 I shall return from there to you soon at the end of spring.

46. To Gordius:53 They say that Hestiaeus has been

 $^{^{51}}$ I.e. even a citizen of the world can only find his ancestor's tombs in his native city. 52 Apollonius stays on Rhodes in VA~5.21-23. 53 The Gordius and Aristocleides of this letter, the Diotimus and Lysias of 48, and the "Ferocianus" of 49 must all be acquaintances of Apollonius from his youth in Tyana.

καὶ ταῦτα φίλου γεγονότος, εἴ γε σύ τινος φίλος. ὅρα δή, Γόρδιε, μὴ πεῖραν λάβης ἀνδρὸς οὐ δοκοῦντος, ἀλλὰ ὅντος. ἄσπασαι τὸν υίὸν ᾿Αριστοκλείδην, ὃν εὕχομαι μὴ παραπλησίον σοι γενέσθαι. καὶ σὺ δ᾽ ἦς νέος ἄμεμπτος.

47. Τυανέων τῆ βουλῆ καὶ τῷ δήμῳ. Προστάττουσιν ὑμιν ἐπανιέναι πείθομαι. †τοῦτο γὰρ δὴ πρὸς ἔνα πόλει† πρεπωδέστερον εἴη, εἰ ἔνεκα τιμῆς μεταπέμποιτο πολίτην ἑαυτῆς. καὶ ὃν ἀποδεδήμηκα δὲ χρόνον, ἀπεδήμησα περιποιῶν ὑμιν, εἰ καὶ ἐπαχθὲς εἰπεῖν, εὕκλειάν τε καὶ ὄνομα καὶ εὕνοιαν καὶ φιλίαν πόλεων ἐπιφανῶν, ὁμοίως δὲ καὶ ἀνδρῶν. εἰ δὲ καὶ μείζονος ἔτι καὶ κρείττονος ὑμεῖς ὑπολήψεως ἄξιοι, τό γε ἐμὸν καὶ τὸ παρὰ τῆς ἐμῆς φύσεως ἐπὶ τοσοῦτον ἐξήρκει μόνον δυνάμεως τε καὶ σπουδῆς.

48.1. Διοτίμφ. Ἐπλανήθης οἰηθεὶς δεῖσθαί μέ τινος η παρ' αὐτοῦ σοῦ, πρὸς ον οὐδὲν ην μοί ποτε κοινόν τι γεγονός, η παρ' ἄλλου τινὸς ὁμοίου τε καὶ ὁμοίως. ην δὲ οὐδὲ τὸ ἀναλωθὲν εἴς τι τῶν σοι σωτηρίων πολύ τι. χαριεῖ δή μοι παθὼν εὖ²¹ δίχ' ἀναλώματος, τηρήσεις²² γάρ μου τὸ ἔθος μόνως οὕτως. ὅτι δὲ τοῦτον ἔχω τὸν τρόπον καὶ ταύτην τὴν διάθεσιν πρὸς ἄπαντάς μου τοὺς πολίτας, ἐῶ γὰρ λέγειν ὡς καὶ πρὸς πάντας ἀνθρώπους, ἔξεστι μαθεῖν παρὰ τῶν ἄλλων πολιτῶν εὖ παθόντων μέν, ὁσάκις ἐδεήθησάν τινος, ἀμοιβὴν δὲ

wronged by you, though you were his friend, if you really are anyone's friend. Take care, Gordius, not to find by experience what a real man is as opposed to the appearance of one. Greet your son Aristocleides from me. I pray he may not turn out like you, since you, too, were once an irreproachable young man.

47. To the assembly and people of Tyana: You order me to return, and I obey, for of course what could be more proper than this, that a city should summon its own citizen to do him honor? For the whole time of my travels abroad, even if I annoy you by saying so, I traveled in order to win you goodwill, fame, and the friendship of distinguished cities and also of distinguished men. And if you deserved an even greater and higher reputation, my own person and my own talents alone would have sufficed to raise you to such influence and admiration.

48.1. To Diotimus: You were wrong to think that I needed anything either from yourself, with whom I have never had anything in common, or from anyone else like you and under similar circumstances. In fact I did not even spend very much on something to save you. ⁵⁵ So you will do me a favor by receiving a benefit and not paying me back, for this is the only way you will help observe my custom. ⁵⁶ This is my practice and this is my disposition to all my fellow citizens (I refrain from adding, "to all humankind"), as you may find from my other compatriots who have received a benefit from me whenever they needed

LETTERS

²¹ χαριεί . . . εὖ Καγ.: χάριν . . . οὐ

²² τηρήσεις Pen.: τηρήσει

⁵⁴ Translation uncertain.

 $^{^{55}}$ It is unclear whether this is a spiritual or some other kind of "salvation."

⁵⁶ I.e., "my custom is only to give, never to receive."

48.2. μὴ δὴ δυσχεράνης, εἰ δεόντως ἐπιτιμηθεὶς ὁ ἐμὸς ὑπὲρ τοῦ προσέσθαι τι τὴν ἀρχήν, ἀπέδωκεν εὐθὺς ὁ ἔλαβε Λυσία τῷ φίλῳ σου, φίλῳ δὲ καὶ ἐμοῦ, ἐπεὶ μηδένα ἠπίστατο τῶν καταλελειμμένων σου παίδων. εἰ δὲ δύο λόγοι περὶ ἐμοῦ λέγονται, λεχθήσονται δὲ καὶ ἐς ὕστερον, τί θαυμαστόν; ἀνάγκη γὰρ περὶ παντὸς ἄκρου δοκοῦντος καθ' ὁτιοῦν ἐναντίους λέγεσθαι λόγους. οὕτως περὶ Πυθαγόρου, περὶ 'Ορφέως, περὶ Πλάτωνος, περὶ Σωκράτους οὐκ ἐλέχθη μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐγράφη τὰ ἐναντία, ὅπου γε <μὴ>²³ τὰ ὅμοια καὶ περὶ αὐτοῦ τοῦ θεοῦ.

48.3. ἀλλ' οἱ μὲν ἀγαθοὶ δέχονται τὸν ἀληθῆ λόγον, ώς ἃν ἔχοντές τι συγγενές, οἱ δὲ φαθλοι τὸν ἐναντίον, καὶ ἔστι τοῦ τοιούτου γένους καταγελᾶν, λέγω δὲ τοῦ χείρονος. τοσοῦτο μόνον δίκαιον ὑπομνῆσαι περὶ ἐμαυτοῦ τὸ νῦν, ὅτι περὶ ἐμοῦ καὶ θεοῖς εἴρηται ὡς περὶ θείου ἀνδρὸς οὐ μόνον ἰδία τισὶ πολλάκις, ἀλλὰ καὶ δημοσία. ἐπαχθὲς λέγειν τι περὶ αὐτοῦ πλεῖον ἣ μεῖζον. ὑγιαίνειν σε εὕχομαι.

49. †Φερουκιανῷ.† Πάνυ τοῖς πεμφθεῖσιν ὑπὸ σοῦ γράμμασιν ἥσθην, πολλὴν γὰρ οἰκειότητα καὶ γένους ἀνάμνησιν εἶχε, καὶ πέπεισμαι δι' ἐπιθυμίας εἶναί σοι θεάσασθαί με καὶ ὑπ' ἐμοῦ θεαθῆναι. αὐτὸς οὖν ἀφίξομαι πρὸς ὑμᾶς ὅτι τάχιστα, καὶ ταύτη που καὶ τοῦ θεοῦ παραινοῦντος, ὅθεν ἔχου τῶν αὐτόθι. συμμίξεις

something, but were never asked for a return.

48.2. Do not therefore be annoyed that my servant, after being properly reprimanded for accepting anything at all, immediately gave away what he had accepted to Lysias, your friend and mine, since he did not know any of the servants whom you left behind. But if two different stories are being told about me, as they will be in the future too, what is surprising about that? It is inevitable, whenever someone is thought outstanding in any respect, that he becomes the subject of contradictory stories. Take for example Pythagoras, Orpheus, Plato, Socrates: contradictory accounts were given of them not only in speech but in writing. Why, discordant accounts are given of God himself.

48.3. Good people, however, accept the true version, having an affinity with it, but bad people accept the contrary one, and we may laugh their kind to scorn, I mean the inferior one. I should properly mention only this about myself for the present, that gods have often spoken of me as of a godlike man not just privately to individuals on many occasions, but publicly as well. It would give annoyance to say anything further or loftier about oneself. I pray for your good health.

49. To Ferocianus:⁵⁷ I was very pleased by the letter that you sent me, since it showed such friendliness and recollection of our blood tie. I am convinced of your eagerness to see me and be seen by me. I will therefore come in person to you all as soon as possible, especially since God seems so to advise me, so please remain where you are. As

LETTERS

 $^{^{57}}$ Cichorius's suggestion for the "Ferucianus" of the manuscripts.

 $^{^{23}\}langle \mu \dot{\eta} \rangle$ Hamaker

δέ μοι πλησίον γενομένω προ των άλλων οἰκείων τε καὶ φίλων, ἐπεὶ καὶ προσήκει σοι τὸ τοιοῦτο.

50. Εὐφράτη. Έν γένει δαιμόνων καὶ ὁ σοφώτατος Πυθαγόρας ήν. σὺ δ' ἔτι μοι δοκεῖς πορρωτάτω φιλοσοφίας είναι καὶ ἀληθινής ἐπιστήμης, ἢ οὐκ ἂν οὕτε έκεινον κακώς έλεγες, ούτε τινάς των ζηλούντων αὐτὸν διετέλεις μισών, άλλο τί σοι νῦν πρακτέον ἂν εἴη. φιλοσοφίας γὰρ "ήμβροτες, οὐδ' ἔτυχες" μᾶλλον ή Μενελάου Πάνδαρος έν τη των "Ορκων Συγχύσει.

51. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἐπιτιμῶσί σοί τινες, ὡς εἰληφότι χρήματα παρά τοῦ βασιλέως, ὅπερ οὐκ ἄτοπον, εἰ μὴ φαίνοιο φιλοσοφίας είληφέναι μισθον καὶ τοσαυτάκις, καὶ ἐπὶ τοσοῦτον, καὶ παρὰ τοσούτων, καὶ παρὰ τοῦ πεπιστευκότος εἶναί σε φιλόσοφον.

52. τῷ αὐτῷ. Ἐάν τις ἀνδρὶ Πυθαγορείῳ συγγένηται, τίνα παρ' αὐτοῦ λήψεται καὶ ὁπόσα; φαίην ἂν έγωγε νομοθετικήν, γεωμετρίαν, αστρονομίαν, αριθμητικήν, άρμονικήν, μουσικήν, ιατρικήν, πάσαν θείαν μαντικήν, τὰ δὲ καλλίω μεγαλοφροσύνην, μεγαλοψυχίαν, μεγαλοπρέπειαν, εὐστάθειαν, εὐφημίαν, γνώσιν θεών, οὐ δόξαν, είδησιν δαιμόνων, οὐχὶ πίστιν, φιλίαν έκατέρων, αὐτάρκειαν, ἐκτένειαν, λιτότητα, Βραχύτητα των άναγκαίων, εὐαισθησίαν, εὐκινησίαν, εὔπνοιαν, εὔχροιαν, ὑγείαν, εὐψυχίαν, ἀθανασίαν. παρὰ σοῦ δέ, Εὐφρᾶτα, τί λαβόντες ἔχουσιν οἱ ἰδόνI come near, you will meet with me before the rest of my intimates and friends, since that privilege is yours by right.

LETTERS

50. To Euphrates: The class of higher beings included the most wise Pythagoras. You, however, still seem to me far removed from philosophy and true understanding, since otherwise you would not revile him, nor pursue a vendetta against certain of his disciples. You should find some other business now, for you have "missed without hitting" philosophy more even than Pandarus did with Menelaus in The Breaking of the Oaths.58

51. To the same: Some criticize you for having accepted money from the emperor. That would not be immoral if you did not appear to have done so as a fee for philosophy, and to have done it so often, to such a degree, from so many people, and from someone who took you for a philosopher.

52. To the same: If someone associates with a true Pvthagorean, what will he will get from him, and in what quantity? I would say: statesmanship, geometry, astronomy, arithmetic, harmonics, music, medicine, complete and god-given prophecy, and also the higher rewardsgreatness of mind, of soul, and of manner, steadiness, piety, knowledge of the gods and not just supposition, familiarity with blessed spirits and not just faith, friendship with both gods and spirits, self-sufficiency, persistence, frugality, reduction of essential needs, ease of perception, of movement, and of breath, good color, health, cheerfulness, and immortality. But what do those who see you come away with, Euphrates? Is it not obviously the excel-

⁵⁸ Iliad 5.287, though The Breaking of the Oaths properly refers to Book 4.

53. Κλαύδιος Τυανέων τῆ βουλῆ. ᾿Απολλώνιον τὸν ὑμέτερον πολίτην, Πυθαγόρειον φιλόσοφον, καλῶς ἐπιδημήσαντα τῆ Ἑλλάδι καὶ τοὺς νέους ἡμῶν ἀφελήσαντα, τιμήσαντες ἀξίαις τιμαῖς, αἷς πρέπει τοὺς ἀγαθοὺς ἄνδρας καὶ ἀληθῶς προϊσταμένους φιλοσοφίας, τὴν εὖνοιαν ἡμῶν ἠθελήσαμεν ὑμῖν δι' ἐπιστολῆς φανερὰν γενέσθαι. ἔρρωσθε.

54. ἀπολλώνιος διοικηταῖς Ῥωμαίων. Λιμένων, καὶ οἰκοδομημάτων, καὶ περιβόλων, καὶ περιπάτων, ἐνίοις ὑμῶν πρόνοια, παίδων δὲ τῶν ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν, ἢ νέων, ἢ γυναικῶν, οὕθ' ὑμῖν οὕτε τοῖς νόμοις φροντίς. ἢ καλὸν ἂν εἴη τὸ ἄρχεσθαι.

55.1. ᾿Απολλώνιος τῷ ἀδελφῷ. Φύσιν ἔχει τῶν τελειωθέντων ἔκαστον ἀπιέναι,²⁴ καὶ τοῦτο παντὶ γῆράς
ἐστι, μεθ' ὁ μηκέτι μένει. μὴ δή σε λυπείτω τῆς
γυναικὸς ἡ ἐν ἀκμῆ τῆς ἡλικίας ἀποβολή, μηδέ, ἐπεὶ
θάνατός τι λέγεται, κρεῖττον αὐτοῦ τὸ ζῆν ὑπολάμβανε, χεῖρον ὃν τῷ παντὶ τοῖς νοῦν ἔχουσι. γενοῦ δὴ
ἀδελφὸς τὸ μὲν κοινότατον φιλοσόφου, τὸ δ' ἐξαίρετον
Πυθαγορείου καὶ ᾿Απολλωνίου, καί σου τὴν οἰκίαν τὴν
αὐτὴν ποίησον. εἰ μὲν γὰρ ἐνεκαλοῦμέν τι τῆ προτέρᾳ,
κἃν εἰκότως ἐδοκοῦμεν ἀποδειλιᾶν, εἰ δ' ἡμῖν σεμνή τε
διετέλεσεν οὖσα καὶ φίλανδρος, καὶ διὰ τοῦτο ἐπιζητήσεως ἀξία, τί καὶ διανοηθέντες οὐκ ἃν ὅμοια καὶ
περὶ τῆς μελλούσης προσδοκοίημεν; ἣν εἰκὸς ἂν ἐθε-

lence that you already possess?59

53. Claudius⁶⁰ to the senate of Tyana: Your citizen Apollonius, the Pythagorean philosopher, has made an excellent visit to Greece and has improved our youth. Having bestowed upon him due honors, such as befit men of virtue who truly represent philosophy, we wanted to make our goodwill evident to you by letter. Goodbye.

54. Apollonius to the Roman procurators:⁶¹ Some of you have the supervision of harbors, buildings, enclosures, and walkways, but the children in the cities, the youth, and the women, are of no concern either to you or to the laws. Otherwise, it would be good to be governed.

55.1. Apollonius to his brother: It is natural for everything that has reached fulfillment to pass away, and for everyone this is old age, after which they remain no more. Do not therefore be grieved by having lost your wife in the prime of life, or suppose that, just because there is something called death, life is superior to it, when really in the opinion of intelligent people it is in every way inferior. Show yourself to be the brother of one who is ordinarily called a philosopher, but more honorably called a Pythagorean and Apollonius, and make your house the same as before. $^{\rm 62}$ For if we had found any fault with your former wife, it would not seem unreasonable for us to hang back. But since we thought her always respectable, devoted to her husband, and hence deserving to be missed, what possible consideration would lead us not to expect the same of your future wife? She will probably wish to prove herself better

²⁴ ἀπιέναι Καγ.: ἀπεῖναι

 ⁵⁹ I.e. no excellence at all.
 60 Perhaps a magistrate of a
 Greek city rather than the Roman emperor.

⁶¹ See Letter 31. 62 I.e., remarry.

ἀμελεία κακωθείσης.

55.2. δυσωπείτω δέ σε καὶ τὰ τῶν ἀδελφῶν οὕτω μέχρι νῦν ἔχοντα. τῷ πρεσβυτάτῳ μὲν γὰρ οὐδὲ γάμος οὐδέπω, τῷ νεωτάτῳ δὲ ἐλπὶς μὲν ἔτι παιδοποιίας, ἐν προκοπῆ δέ γε τοῦ χρόνου, καὶ ἡμεῖς μὲν ένὶ τρεῖς γεγόναμεν, τρισὶ δ' ἡμῖν οὐδὲ εἶς. ἴσος δὲ καὶ ὁ κίνδυνος τῆ πατρίδι καὶ τῷ βίῳ τῷ μεθ' ἡμᾶς. εἰ γὰρ ἡμεῖς ἀμείνους τοῦ πατρός (ἄλλως δέ, καθ' ὁ πατήρ, χείρους), πῶς οὐκ ἄν βελτίους ἐξ ἡμῶν εἰκὸς ἄν ὑπάρξαι; γενέσθωσαν οὖν τινες, οἶς παραθησόμεθα γοῦν ὀνόματα, ὡς ἡμῶν οἱ πρόγονοι συνύφηναν. ὑπὸ δακρύων οὐχ οἶός τε ἐγενόμην πλείονα γράψαι, καὶ οὐδὲ εἶχον ἀναγκαιότερα τούτων.

56. Σαρδιανοῖς. Κροῖσος ἀπέβαλε τὴν Λυδῶν ἀρχὴν "Αλυν διαβάς, ἐλήφθη ζῶν, ἐδέθη πέδαις, ἐπὶ
πυρὰν²5 ἀνεβιβάσθη, τὸ πῦρ εἶδεν ἡμμένον, αἰρόμενον εἰς ὕψος ἔζησεν, ἐδόκει γὰρ τῷ θεῷ τετιμημένος.
τί οὖν ὕστερον; οὖτος ὁ πρόγονος ὑμῶν ἄμα καὶ
βασιλεύς, ὁ τοσαῦτα παθὼν παρὰ τὴν ἀξίαν, τραπέζης ἐκοινώνησε τῷ πολεμίῳ, σύμβουλος ἢν εὕνους,
πιστός, φίλος. ὑμῖν δὲ ἄσπονδα καὶ ἀκήρυκτα καὶ
ἀμείλικτα ἔτι τε ἀνίερα καὶ ἄθεα τὰ πρὸς γονεῖς, πρὸς
τέκνα, πρὸς ἀδελφούς, πρὸς γυναῖκας, τὰ πρὸς φίλους
συγγενεῖς φυλέτας. ἐχθροὶ γεγόνατε μήτε τὸν "Αλυν
διαβάντες, μήτε δεξάμενοί τινα ἄνθρωπον ἔξωθεν, καὶ

than her predecessor, since your former wife was never made worse by neglect.

55.2. You should also feel abashed at the way your brothers have fared up to now. For the oldest of us has not even married yet, and the youngest has prospects of having children, but only in the course of time. We are three sons of a single father, but the three of us have not a single son. In addition, there is equal danger for our ancestral city and for the generations after us. For if we are better than our father was (though generally speaking we are inferior to him in that he was our father), must we not expect that those born from us will be better? So let there be some people to whom at least we shall leave our names, just as our forebears contrived for us. My tears prevent me from writing any more, and in fact I have no more pressing subject to write about.

56. To the Sardians: Croesus lost his kingdom of Lydia by crossing the Halys. He was taken alive, bound in chains, placed on a pyre, and saw the fire being lit and rising high. But he lived, for he seemed to be a man honored by the god. And what happened later? This man, both your ancestor and your king, who had so many undeserved sufferings, became his enemy's table companion, and was his benevolent, faithful, friendly counselor. You, however, have a war without truce, treaty, or reconciliation towards parents, children, brothers, wives, friends, relatives, and fellow tribesmen. You have become enemies without crossing the Halys or receiving any person from abroad, and yet

⁶³ In Herodotus, Croesus, king of Lydia, is overthrown by Cyrus the Great, and then becomes his advisor.

ή γη φέρει καρπὸν ὑμῖν. ἄδικος ἡ γη.

57. συγγραφεῦσι λογίοις. Φῶς παρουσία πυρός, ἢ οὖκ ἂν ἄλλως γένοιτο. πῦρ μὲν οὖν αὐτὸ τὸ πάθος, καὶ ῷ γίνεται, καίεται γοῦν, φῶς δὲ ταῖς ὅψεσι μόνον αὐγὴν ἑαυτοῦ παρέχεται μὴ βιαζόμενον αὐτάς, ἀλλὰ πεῖθον. τοίνυν καὶ λόγος ὁ μὲν ὥσπερ πῦρ καὶ πάθος, ὁ δὲ ὥσπερ αὐγὴ καὶ φῶς ἐστιν ὁ κρεῖττον ὄν, εἰ μὴ μεῖζον εὐχῆς τὸ ῥηθησόμενον, εἴη μοι.

58.1. Οὐαλερίῳ. Θάνατος οὐδεὶς οὐδενὸς ἢ μόνον ἐμφάσει, καθάπερ οὐδὲ γένεσις οὐδενὸς ἢ μόνον ἐμφάσει. τὸ μὲν γὰρ ἐξ οὐσίας τραπὲν εἰς φύσιν ἔδοξε γένεσις, τὸ δὲ ἐκ φύσεως εἰς οὐσίαν κατὰ ταὐτὰ θάνατος οὕτε γιγνομένου κατ' ἀλήθειάν τινος, οὕτε φθειρομένου ποτέ, μόνον δὲ ἐμφανοῦς ὄντος ἀοράτου τε ὕστερον τοῦ μὲν διὰ παχύτητα τῆς ὕλης, τοῦ δὲ διὰ λεπτότητα τῆς οὐσίας, οὕσης μὲν αἰεὶ τῆς αὐτῆς, κινήσει δὲ διαφερούσης καὶ στάσει.

58.2. τοῦτο γάρ που τὸ ἴδιον ἀνάγκη, τῆς μεταβολῆς οὖκ ἔξωθεν γινομένης ποθέν, ἀλλὰ τοῦ μὲν ὅλου μεταβάλλοντος εἰς τὰ μέρη, τῶν μερῶν δὲ εἰς τὸ ὅλον τρεπομένων ἐνότητι τοῦ παντός. εἰ δὲ ἐρήσεταί τις, "τί τοῦτό ἐστι τὸ ποτὲ μὲν ὁρατόν ποτὲ δὲ ἀόρατον the earth brings you crops.⁶⁴ The earth is unjust.

57. To learned authors: 65 Light is the presence of fire, for otherwise it could not exist. Well then, fire is simply an effect, and whatever feels the effect certainly burns. Light however merely offers its radiance to the eyes, not by compulsion but by persuasion. It follows that discourse is either like fire, an effect, or like light, a radiance. The second is preferable, and unless what I am about to say is beyond praying for, may I possess it.

58.1. To Valerius:⁶⁶ There is no death of anything except only in appearance, just as there is no coming-to-be of anything except in appearance only. For the passage from substance into nature seems like coming-to-be, and likewise the passage from nature into substance seems like death. Yet nothing ever really comes to be or passes away; it merely is now visible and later invisible, the first by reason of its material density, the second by reason of its light substance. Substance is always the same, and changes only as it moves or stands still.

58.2. This, I suppose, has to be its characteristic quality, since its change does not have an external origin, but rather occurs when the whole dissolves into its parts, or when the parts return to the whole because of the oneness of the all. Suppose someone asks, "What is this that becomes visible at one time and invisible at another, either

⁶⁴ Halys: river of northern Asia Minor, which Croesus crossed in an ill-fated campaign against the Persian king Cyrus; before that, he had given hospitality to the Phrygian Adrastus, in whose company his son Atys was killed. "Crops" probably refers to the Sardian cult of Demeter "Bringer of Crops" (Karpophoros), see Letter 75.

⁶⁵ For Apollonius's low opinion of certain authors, see VA 4.30.
66 Probably Valerius Asiaticus Saturninus, consul in 94 and proconsul of Asia in 108/09, though such a date does not accord with Philostratus's chronology in the Life; C. Cichorius's proposal of Valerius Festus, consul in 71 and again in 85, might be correct, though he is not attested as proconsul of Asia.

58.3. τί δὲ καὶ τὸ τῆς πλάνης ἐπὶ τοσοῦτον ἀνέλεγκτον; οἴονται γάρ τινες, ὁ πεπόνθασιν, αὐτοὶ τοῦτο πεποιηκέναι, μὴ εἰδότες, ὡς ὁ γεννηθεὶς διὰ γονέων γεγέννηται, οὐχ ὑπὸ γονέων, καθάπερ τὸ διὰ γῆς φυὲν οὐκ ἐκ γῆς φύεται, πάθος τε οὐδὲν τῶν φαινομένων περὶ ἔκαστον, ἀλλὰ μᾶλλον περὶ ἔν²6 ἑκάστου. τοῦτο δὲ τί ἂν ἄλλο τις εἰπὼν ἢ τὴν πρώτην οὐσίαν ὀρθῶς ἂν ὀνομάσειεν; ἢ δὴ μόνη ποιεῖ τε καὶ πάσχει πᾶσι γινομένη πάντα διὰ πάντων, θεὸς ἀίδιος, ὀνόμασι καὶ προσώποις ἀφαιρουμένη τὸ ἴδιον ἀδικουμένη τε.

58.4. καὶ τοῦτο μὲν ἔλαττον, τὸ δὲ κλαίεταί τις, ὅταν θεὸς ἐξ ἀνθρώπου γένηται τόπου μεταβάσει καὶ οὐχὶ φύσεως. ὡς δὲ ἔχει τὸ ἀληθές, οὐ πενθητέον σοι θάνατον, ἀλλὰ τιμητέον καὶ σεβαστέον. τιμὴ δὲ ἡ ἀρίστη τε καὶ πρέπουσα, εἰ ἀφεὶς θεῷ τὸν ἐκεῖ γενόμενον ἀνθρώπων τῶν πεπιστευμένων τὰ νῦν ἄρχοις, ἡ πρότερον ἦρχες. αἰσχρόν, εἰ χρόνφ μὴ λογισμῷ γένοιο βελτίων, εἰ χρόνος καὶ τοὺς κακοὺς λύπης ἔπαυ-

26 εν ΟΙ.: ένὸς

for the same observers or for different ones?" One can reply that it is the way of each earthly species, when being filled, to become visible because of the resistance caused by density, whereas it becomes invisible on being rarefied because of the lightness of its constituent material, for this is forcibly dispersed and escapes from the eternal measure that contained it, and yet it is in no way capable of coming to be or of perishing.

58.3. How then does error go uncorrected for so long? For some people think that they themselves have caused what they have experienced, forgetting that what is engendered is engendered through its parents, not by its parents, just something that grows through the earth does not grow from the earth, forgetting too that nothing that appears relates to an individual, but each individual's experience relates to the One. And what could anyone call this in order to name it properly other than "the first substance"? This alone both acts and is acted upon, becoming all things for all beings everywhere, eternal godhead, which names and appearances only deprive of its essence and do it wrong.

58.4. That however is minor, but the fact is this: a person is lamented when he becomes a god instead of a human being, by a change of place and not of nature. The truth is that you should not grieve over death, but honor and revere it. The best and most fitting honor is that you resign to God someone who has gone there, ⁶⁷ and now govern the people entrusted to you in the way you did before. It would be a disgrace to be made a better person by time and not by reflection, since time cures even bad people of

⁶⁷ I.e., has gone to be with God.

58.5. ποῦ δὲ καὶ ὅσιον ἀπεύχεσθαι τὸ βουλήσει θεοῦ γενόμενον; εἰ τάξις ἐστὶ τῶν ὅντων, ἔστι δέ, καὶ θεὸς ἐπιστατεῖ ταύτης, ὁ δίκαιος οὐ βουλήσεται τὰ ἀγαθά, πλεονεκτικὸν γὰρ καὶ παρὰ τάξιν τὸ τοιοῦτον, ἡγήσεται δὲ τὰ γινόμενα συμφέρειν. πρόελθε καὶ θεράπευσαι δίκας, καὶ παρηγόρησον τοὺς αἰτίους, τῶν δὲ δακρύων οὕτως ἀποτρέψη. 27 οὐ τὰ ἴδια τῶν κοινῶν, ἀλλὰ τὰ κοινὰ τῶν ἰδίων προτιμητέον. οἶον δέ σοι καὶ τὸ τῆς παραμυθίας εἶδος σὲν ὅλφ τὸν υίὸν ἔθνει πεπένθηκας.

58.6. ἄμειψαι τοὺς μετὰ σοῦ λελυπημένους, ἀμείψη δέ, ἐὰν λυπούμενος παύση, τάχιον <ἢ>28 ἐὰν μὴ προέλθης. φίλους οὐκ ἔχεις; υίὸν δὲ ἔχεις. "καὶ νῦν τὸν τεθνηκότα;" φήσει τις τῶν νοῦν ἐχόντων. τὸ γὰρ ὂν οὐκ ἀπόλλυται, διὰ τοῦτο ὅν, ὅτι ἔσται διὰ παντός, ἣ καὶ τὸ μὴ ὂν γίνεται, πῶς δ' ἂν γένοιτο μὴ ἀπολλυμένου τοῦ ὅντος; εἶπεν ἂν ἔτερός τις, ὡς ἀσεβεῖς τε καὶ ἀδικεῖς. ἀσεβεῖς μὲν τὸν θεόν, ἀδικεῖς δὲ τὸν υἱόν, μᾶλλον δὲ κἀκεῖνον ἀσεβεῖς· βούλει δὲ μαθεῖν οἷόν ἐστι θάνατος; ἄνελέ με πέμψας μετὰ ταύτην τὴν φωνήν, ἢν ἐὰν μὴ μεταμφιέση, παραχρῆμα κρείττονά με σεαυτοῦ πεποίηκας.

58.7. ἔχεις χρόνον, ἔχεις γυναῖκα ἔμφρονα, φίλαν-

sorrow. Good government is a weighty matter with weighty concerns, and the best governor is he who begins by governing himself.

58.5. How too could it possibly be right to deprecate what comes about by God's will? If there is an order of existing things, as there is, and God presides over this order, the just man will not wish for the good, for to do so would be greedy and and contrary to the order: instead he will regard all that happens as proper. Appear in public, reconcile disputes, calm the guilty, and in this way you will leave your tears behind. We must not put our own interests before the general ones, but the general ones before our own. And consider what kind of consolation you have: the whole province has joined you in grieving your son.

58.6. Repay those who have grieved alongside yourself, as you will if you cease grieving, and sooner than if you fail to appear in public. Have you no friends? Well, you have a son even now. "What, the one who has just died?" Yes, so anyone of good sense will tell you. For what has existence does not perish, since that is why it exists—because it will exist for ever. Otherwise it would be that the nonexistent came into existence, and how could it do that unless what existed perished? Someone else might have said that you commit impiety and injury, impiety to God and injury to your son, or rather impiety to him too. Do you want to know the nature of death? Then summon and kill me after this remark of mine, which you must take on like new clothing, or else you have immediately made me better than yourself.⁶⁸

58.7. You have time, you have a wife who is wise and de-

²⁷ ἀποτρέψη Valck.: ἀποτρέψεις

^{28 &}lt; n> Spengel

⁶⁸ Meaning obscure.

δρον, ὁλόκληρος εἶ, παρὰ σεαυτοῦ λαβὲ τὸ λεῖπον. 'Ρωμαΐός τις των πάλαι γεγονότων, ίνα σώση τον τής άρχης νόμον τε καὶ κόσμον, υίὸν ἴδιον ἀπέκτεινε καὶ στεφανώσας ἀπέκτεινε. πόλεων ἄρχεις πεντακοσίων 'Ρωμαίων ὁ εὐγενέστατος, ταῦτα σαυτὸν διατίθης, ἐξ ὧν οὐδ' οἰκίας τις εὐσταθῶς ἄρξει, μήτι γε πόλεών τε καὶ ἐθνῶν. ᾿Απολλώνιος εἰ παρῆν, Φαβοῦλλαν ἃν μὴ πενθείν έπεισεν.

59. Βασιλεύς Βαβυλωνίων Γάρμος Νεογύνδη Ίνδων βασιλεί. Εἰ μὴ περίεργος ἦς, οὐκ ἂν ἦς ἐν τοῖς άλλοτρίοις πράγμασι δίκαιος, οὐδὲ ἂν ἄρχων ἐν Ἰνδοίς ἐδίκαζες Βαβυλωνίοις. πόθεν γάρ σοι γνώριμος ην ὁ ημέτερος δημος;29 νῦν δὲ ἐπείρασας ἀρχην την έμην ύποκοριζόμενος έπιστολαίς, καὶ τοιαύτας ἀρχὰς καθιείς, καὶ πρόσχημα ποιούμενος τῆς πλεονεξίας τὴν φιλανθρωπίαν. περανείς δὲ οὐδέν, οὐδὲ³⁰ γὰρ λαθείν δύναιο.

60. Εὐφράτη. εΗν Πραξιτέλης Χαλκιδεύς μαινόμενος ἄνθρωπος. οὖτος ὤφθη παρὰ ταῖς θύραις ταῖς έμαις ξίφος έχων έν Κορίνθω μετά σοῦ γνωρίμου. τίς οὖν ή τῆς ἐπιβουλῆς αἰτία;

29 δήμος ΟΙ.: δήμιος 30 οὐδὲ Hercher: οὕτε

69 T. Manlius Torquatus, consul in 340 BCE, put his son to death for disobeying military orders.

70 The province of Asia was sometimes regarded as containing five hundred cities, probably an exaggeration.

voted, you have good health, the rest you must obtain from yourself. A certain Roman who lived long ago, because he wanted to maintain the rights and dignity of his office, killed his own son, and did so after crowning him.69 You govern five hundred cities, 70 and have the finest pedigree in Rome.⁷¹ But you are behaving in such a way as not even to rule your own household with a steady hand, let alone cities and districts. If Apollonius had been present, he would have persuaded Fabulla⁷² not to mourn.

59. Garmus, king of the Babylonians, to Neogyndes, king of the Indians:73 If you were not given to interfering, you would not be administering justice⁷⁴ in other people's concerns, or be sitting in judgment on Babylonians as ruler of India. For how on earth could our people be known to you? As it is, you have made an attempt on my realm, sending cajoling letters, dispatching officials of various kinds, and using friendliness as a mask for greed. But you will achieve nothing, for you cannot even avoid detection.

60. Apollonius to Euphrates: Praxiteles of Chalcis was a person deranged.75 He appeared at my door, sword in hand, in Corinth together with your pupil. So what is the excuse for this plot?

⁷¹ Valerius Asiaticus (n. 66) came from a wealthy and wellconnected family of Vienna in Gaul (modern Vienne).

⁷² Presumably the proconsul's wife.

⁷³ No such kings are known; a Garmus king of Babylon is found in Iamblichus's novel, Babyloniaca, and this letter might have crept in from a similar source.

⁷⁴ Meaning uncertain.

⁷⁵ Cf. Letter 36.

οὐ γὰρ πώποτε σὰς βοῦς ἤλασα . . . ἐπει ἦ μάλα πολλὰ μεταξὺ οὕρεά τε σκιόεντα θάλασσά τε ἠχήεσσα"

τής τε έμης φιλοσοφίας καὶ τής σής.

61. Λεσβώνακτι. ἀνάχαρσις ὁ Σκύθης ἦν σοφός, εἰ δὲ Σκύθης, ὅτι καὶ Σκύθης.

62.1. Λακεδαιμόνιοι ἀπολλωνίφ. Τᾶν δεδομενᾶν τιμᾶν σοι ἀπεστάλκαμεν τόδε ἀντίγραφον σαμανάμενοι τᾶ δαμοσία σφραγίδι, ἵνα εἴδης.³¹

62.2 Ψήφισμα Λακεδαιμονίων, καθώς οἱ γέροντες ἐπέκριναν Τυνδάρεω εἰσηγησαμένω ταῖν ἀρχαῖν ἔδοξε, τέλεσί τε καὶ τῷ δήμῳ, ᾿Απολλώνιον Πυθαγόρειον ἢμεν πολίταν ἔχειν τε καὶ γᾶς³² καὶ οἰκίας ἔγκτασιν.³³ ἐστάκαμεν δὲ καὶ ἐπίσαμον εἰκόνα γραπτὰν καὶ χαλκᾶν ἀρετῆς χάριν. ὧδε γὰρ οἱ πατέρες ἁμῶν ἐτίμων ἄνδρας ἀγαθούς. ἐνόμιζον γὰρ ἦμεν Λυκούργω παῖδας, ὅσοι σύμφωνον θεοῖς τὸν βίον αἰρέοντο. [ταῦτα ἀναγνοὺς οὐκ ἐχαυνώθη ταῖς τιμαῖς καὶ τοὶς ἐπαίνοις, ὥστε ἀποκρίνεσθαι τὰ κεχαρισμένα καὶ μὴ ἀληθῆ, ἰδὼν δὲ τοὺς πρέσβεις οὐ πάνυ Λακωνικούς, οὐχ ἡσθεὶς αὐτοῖς ἀνεπιτίθησι τήνδε τὴν ἐπιστολήν·]

63. ἀπολλώνιος ἐφόροις καὶ Λακεδαιμονίοις. Ἅνδρας ὑμῶν ἐθεασάμην ὑπήνην μὴ ἔχοντας, τοὺς μηροὺς καὶ τὰ σκέλη λείους τε καὶ λευκούς, μαλακὰς For never did I drive away your herds . . . since many a mountain lies deep-shaded, and resounding sea between 76

my philosophy and yours.

61. To Lesbonax: Anacharsis⁷⁷ the Scythian was a wise man, and if he was a Scythian, that was why he was wise.

62.1. The Lacedaemonians to Apollonius: We have sent this copy of the honors we are giving you, sealing it with

the public seal for your information:

the Elders on the motion of Tyndareus: It was resolved by the two authorities, that is, the magistrates and the people, that Apollonius the Pythagorean should be a citizen and have the right to own land and house. We have also set up a conspicuous portrait of him painted on bronze because of his excellence. For thus our fathers honored good men, thinking all who chose a life consonant with the gods to be descendants of Lycurgus. [On reading this, he was not carried away by the praises and the honors so as to send an answer that was pleasing rather than honest. Seeing that the ambassadors were not truly Spartan, and displeased with them, he replied with the following letter.]

63. Apollonius to the ephors and Lacedaemonians: I observed that your men did not have beards, that their legs and thighs were smooth and white, that they were dressed

 $^{^{31}}$ ϵ ĭ δ η s Cob.: ĭ δ η s

 ³² γᾶς Cob.: γάνος
 33 οἰκίας ἔγκτασιν Cob.: οἴκων ἔκτασιν

⁷⁶ Iliad 1.154, 156-57.

⁷⁷ Legendary Scythian prince of the sixth century BCE, famed as a barbarian sage.

⁷⁸ The legendary Spartan lawgiver.

⁷⁹ This "filler," preserved in several manuscripts (Penella 4 n. 15), appears to have no ancient authority.

χλανίδας ημφιεσμένους <καί>34 βαπτάς, δακτυλίους πολλούς και καλούς περικειμένους, ύποδεδεμένους ύπόδημα τὸ Ἰωνικόν. οὐκ ἐπέγνων οὖν τοὺς λεγομένους πρέσβεις, ή δὲ ἐπιστολὴ Λακεδαιμονίους ἔφασκεν.

64. τοῖς αὐτοῖς. Καλεῖτέ με πολλάκις βοηθὸν ὑμῖν τῶν νόμων καὶ τῶν νέων ἐσόμενον. ἡ Σόλωνος δὲ πόλις οὐ καλεῖ με. Λυκοῦργον αἰδεῖσθε.

65. Ἐφεσίων τοῖς ἐν ᾿Αρτέμιδος. ³5 Ἦθος ὑμῖν ἄπαν ἀγιστείας, ἔθος δὲ βασιλικῆς τιμῆς. ἄλλ᾽ ὑμεῖς ἑστι- άτορες μὲν καὶ δαιτυμόνες οὐ μεμπτοί, μεμπτοὶ δὲ <οί>³6 σύνοικοι τῆ θεῷ νύκτας τε καὶ ἡμέρας, ἢ οὐκ ἂν ὁ κλέπτης τε καὶ ληστὴς καὶ ἀνδραποδιστὴς καὶ πᾶς, εἴ τις ἄδικος ἢ ἱερόσυλος, ἦν ὁρμώμενος αὐτόθεν τὸ γὰρ τῶν ἀποστερούντων τεῖχος ³7 ἐστιν.

66. τοις αὐτοις. ³Ηλθεν ἐκ τῆς Ἑλλάδος ἀνὴρ Ελλην τὴν φύσιν, οὐκ Ἀθηναίος, οὐδὲ Μεγαρεύς γε, λῷον δ' ὄνομα³⁸ παροικήσων ὑμῶν τῆ θεῷ. δότε μοι τόπον, ἔνθα μὴ καθαρσίων δεήσει μοι καίπερ ἔνδον ἀεὶ μένοντι.

67. τοῖς αὐτοῖς. ἀνεῖται θύουσι τὸ ἱερόν, εὐχομένοις, ὑμνοῦσιν, ἰκέταις, Ἕλλησι, βαρβάροις, ἐλευθέροις, δούλοις. ὑπερφυῶς θεῖος ὁ νόμος. ἐπιγινώσκω τὰ

in soft, dyed cloaks, that they wore many fine rings and had Ionian shoes. ⁸⁰ I did not therefore recognize the so-called ambassadors, though the letter called them Lacedaemonians.

64. To the same persons: You often summon me to assist your laws and your youth, while Solon's city does not do so. 81 Revere Lycurgus.

65. To the Ephesians in the Sanctuary of Artemis: You observe every detail of religion, every detail of honor to the emperor. But while *you* are beyond reproach as "Feast Givers" and "Dinner Guests," the reproach lies with those who lodge with the Goddess night and day, since otherwise the thief, the bandit, the kidnapper, everyone of a sinful and sacrilegious nature, would not be issuing from there. Why, the sanctuary is a robbers' castle. 83

66. To the same: Someone Greek by nature has come from Greece, not an Athenian or a Megarian, but someone with a better name planning to reside with your goddess. Solve me a place where I shall not need purification, even though I always stay indoors. So

67. To the same: The sanctuary is open to those who sacrifice, pray, sing hymns, take refuge, to Greeks and barbarians, free men and slaves. This custom is exceptionally

^{34 &}lt;καί> Kay.

^{35 &#}x27;Αρτέμιδος Ol.: 'Αρτέμιδι

^{36 (}oi) Wilamowitz

³⁷ τείχος Ol.: τύχης

³⁸ γε, λῷον δ' ὄνομα Καγ.: γελοῖον ὄνομα

⁸⁰ Ionia was notorious for its luxurious products.

⁸¹ Athens. For opposition to Apollonius there, VA 4.18, 5.20.

⁸² Apparently titles of those who participated in sacred feasts honoring Artemis. Pausanias, Description of Greece 8.13.1, also mentions "Feast Givers" (histiatores) at Ephesus.

⁸³ Suppliants in the Temple of Artemis of Ephesus were immune from seizure (*asyloi*), so that the place was a favorite haunt of fugitives from justice.

84 Le. Apollonius himself.

⁸⁵ On this habit of Apollonius, see Letter 8.1.

67a. Λουκίφ Μεστρίφ Φλώρφ ἀνθυπάτφ παρὰ Λουκίου Πομπηΐου ᾿Απολλωνίου Ἐφεσίου. μυστήρια καὶ θυσίαι, κύριε, καθ᾽ ἔκαστον ἐνιαυτὸν ἐπιτελοῦνται ἐν Ἐφέσφ Δήμητρι Καρποφόρφ καὶ Θεσμοφόρφ καὶ θεοῖς Σεβαστοῖς ὑπὸ μυστῶν μετὰ πολλῆς ἀγνείας καὶ νομίμων ἐθῶν σὺν ταῖς ἱερίαις, ἀπὸ πλείστων ἐτῶν συντετηρημένα ἀπὸ βασιλέων καὶ Σεβαστῶν καὶ τῶν κατ᾽ ἐνιαυτὸν ἀνθυπάτων, καθὼς αἱ παρακείμεναι ἐπιστολαὶ αὐτῶν περιέχουσιν. ὅθεν, ἐπειγόντων καὶ ἐπὶ σοῦ τῶν μυστηρίων, ἀναγκαίως, κύριε, ἐντυγχάνουσί σοι δὶ ἐμοῦ οἱ ὀφείλοντες τὰ μυστήρια ἐπιτελεῖν, ἵνα ἐπιγνοὺς αὐτῶν τὰ δίκαια . . .

68. Μιλησίοις. Σεισμὸς ὑμῶν τὴν γῆν ἔσεισεν, καὶ γὰρ ἄλλων πολλῶν πολλάκις. ἀλλ' ἔπασχον μὲν ἃ ἢτύχουν ἐξ ἀνάγκης, ἐλεοῦντες δέ, οὐ μισοῦντες ἀλλήλους ἐφαίνοντο. μόνοι δὲ ὑμεῖς καὶ θεοῖς ὅπλα καὶ πῦρ ἐπηνέγκατε καὶ θεοῖς τοιούτοις, ὧν καὶ οἱ ἑτέρωθεν δέονται καὶ μετὰ κινδύνους καὶ πρὸ κινδύνων. ἀλλὰ καὶ φιλόσοφον ἄνδρα †προ ἡμεῖς Ἑλλήνων δύο† δημοσία τὸ πάθημα φήναντα καὶ πολλάκις, καὶ προαγο-

 $39 \langle \tau \hat{\eta} \varsigma \rangle$ Pen.

godly. I recognize the marks of the daughter of Zeus and Leto,⁸⁶ if these are the only ones.

67a.⁸⁷ To Lucius Mestrius Florus proconsul, from Lucius Pompeius Apollonius of Ephesus.⁸⁸ Mysteries and sacrifices, my lord, are performed every year in Ephesus to Demeter Bringer of Crops and Giver of Laws and to the deified emperors by celebrants with great holiness and law-abiding customs together with the priestesses, (and have been) preserved by kings and Augusti and the yearly proconsuls, as their attached letters demonstrate. Wherefore, as the mysteries are approaching in your term also, those who are due to perform the mysteries necessarily appeal to you through me so that, recognizing their rights...

68. To the Milesians: An earthquake⁸⁹ has shaken your land, as has often happened to many other peoples. But the misfortune that overtook them was inevitable, and they showed pity for one another rather than hate. You alone have brought weapons and fire even against the gods, and what is more, against gods of such a kind that people from elsewhere call on them both before and after danger.⁹⁰ And when a notable philosopher. . .⁹¹ publicly and repeatedly foretold the disaster, and prophesied that the earth-

The identification of the writer with Apollonius of Tyana is conjectural.

88 Mestrius Florus was a Roman senator, best known as a friend of Plutarch. If the writer of this letter is Apollonius of Tyana, he had received both Roman citizenship and the citizenship of Ephesus.

89 Perhaps the same earthquake as in VA 4.6.

90 Public disasters sometimes inflamed popular anger and led to attacks on temples and divine statues.

91 I.e. Apollonius himself. The following words are corrupt.

⁸⁶ Artemis.

⁸⁷ This letter is preserved in an inscription of Ephesus (Wilhelm Dittenberger, *Sylloge Inscriptionum Graecarum*³ 820; R. Merkelbach and others, *Die Inschriften von Ephesos* no. 213).

ρεύσαντα γενομένους τούς σεισμούς, αὐτόν, ὅτε ἔσεισεν ὁ θεός, ποιείν ἐλέγετε καθ' ἐκάστην ἡμέραν, ὡ τῆς δημοσίας άμαθίας, καὶ πατήρ ύμων λέγεται Θαλής.

69. Τραλλιανοίς. Πολλοί πολλαχόθεν άλλοι κατ' άλλας αιτίας νεώτεροί τε και πρεσβύτεροι φοιτώσι παρ' έμέ, τὰς φύσεις οὖν ένὸς έκάστου σκέπτομαι καὶ τοὺς τρόπους, ὡς ἔνι μάλιστα συνετώτατα, τό τε πρὸς την έαυτοῦ πόλιν έκάστου δίκαιον ήθος ή τουναντίον. είς τήνδε τὴν ἡμέραν οὐκ ἂν ἔχοιμι προκρίναι Τραλλιανών ύμων οὐ Λυδούς, οὐκ Αχαιούς, οὐκ Ίωνας. άλλ' οὐδὲ τοὺς τῆς ἀρχαίας Ἑλλάδος Θουρίους Κροτωνιάτας 40 Ταραντίνους, ή τινας άλλους των έκει λεγομένων εὐδαιμόνων Ἰταλιωτών ἢ έτέρων τινών, τίς οὖν ἡ αἰτία, δι' ἡν ἀποδέχομαι μὲν ὑμᾶς, οὐ γίνομαι δὲ τοιούτοις ἀνδράσι σύνοικος, καίπερ ὢν γένος ὑμέτερον; ἄλλοτέ ποτ' αν είποιμι, νθν δὲ μόνον ύμας ἐπαινείν καιρὸς ἄνδρας τε τοὺς ἡγουμένους ὑμῶν, ὡς πολὺ κρείττους των παρ' έτέροις άρετη καὶ λόγω, καὶ μάλ- $\lambda o \nu \langle \tau \hat{\omega} \nu \rangle^{41} \pi a \rho' o is \gamma \epsilon \gamma \epsilon \nu \eta \nu \tau a \iota$

70. Σαίταις. 'Αθηναίων ἀπόγονοί ἐστε, καθάπερ ἐν Τιμαίω Πλάτων φησίν, οί δὲ τὴν κοινὴν ὑμῶν θεὸν έξορίζουσι τῆς 'Αττικῆς Νηὶθ42 μεν τὴν ὑφ' ὑμῶν, 'Αθηναν δε την ύπ' αὐτων ὀνομαζομένην, οὐ μένοντες

LETTERS

quakes would occur, then after the god had sent the quake, you said day after day that he was responsible. What public ignorance! And they say that Thales was your ancestor.92

69. To the Trallians. 93 Many people from many places and for all kinds of reason, both young and old, follow me. So I observe the nature and character of each person as shrewdly as any one person can, and also his disposition towards his native city, whether dutiful or the opposite. To this day I cannot rank anyone above you Trallians, not Lydians, not Achaeans, not Ionians, not even the Thurians, Crotoniates, or Tarentines of old Greece nor any of the other fortunate Italians, as they are called there, nor anyone else. What then is the reason why I approve of you, but do not take up residence with men of such worth, though I am related to you?94 I might tell you some other time, but now is the moment simply to praise you, and also to praise your leaders for being far superior to leaders elsewhere in virtue and speech, and superior to a greater degree to the leaders with whom they have consorted.95

70. To the people of Sais: You are descendants of the Athenians, so Plato says in the Timaeus. 96 They however banish from Attica the goddess whom they share with you, called Neith by you and Athena by them, and thus they no

⁴⁰ Κροτωνιάτας Καγ.: Κρότωνας

^{41 (}των > Kay.

⁴² Νηὶθ Ol.: Νῆιν

⁹² Natural philosopher of Miletus famous for predicting an eclipse in 585 BCE.

⁹³ Tralles was an important city of Caria (modern Aydın).

⁹⁴ Possibly referring to some mythical connection between 95 Unclear, but perhaps a veiled refer-Tralles and Tyana. 96 Sais was an important ence to the Roman authorities. city in the Nile Delta, and the Greeks had long ago identified its war goddess Neith with Athena. Plato: Timaeus 21 E.

Έλληνες. ὅπως δ' οὐ μένοντες, ἐγὼ φράσω γέρων σοφὸς οὐδεὶς ᾿Αθηναῖος, οὐ γὰρ ἔφυ γένυς⁴³ πᾶσα παντός, ὅτι μηδεμία μηδενός. ὁ κόλαξ παρὰ ταῖς πύλαις, ὁ συκοφάντης πρὸ τῶν πυλῶν, ὁ μαστροπὸς καὶ πρὸ τῶν μακρῶν τειχῶν, ὁ παράσιτος πρὸ τῆς Μουνυχίας καὶ πρὸ τοῦ Πειραιῶς, ἡ θεὸς δὲ οὐδὲ Σούνιον ἔχει.

71. Ἰωσιν. Ἦληνες οἴεσθε δεῖν ὀνομάζεσθαι διὰ τὰ γένη καὶ τὴν ἔμπροσθεν ἀποικίαν, Ἦλησι δ' ὅσπερ ἔθη καὶ νόμοι καὶ γλῶττα καὶ βίος ἴδιος, οὕτω καὶ σχῆμα καὶ εἶδος ἀνθρώπων. ἀλλ' ὑμῶν γε οὐδὲ τὰ ὀνόματα μένει τοῖς πολλοῖς, ἀλλ' ὑπὸ τῆς νέας ταύτης εὐδαιμονίας ἀπολωλέκατε τὰ τῶν προγόνων σύμβολα. [καλῶς]⁴⁴ οὐδὲ τοῖς τάφοις ἐκεῖνοι δέχοιντ' ἄν ἄτε ἀγνῶτας αὐτοῖς γενομένους, εἴ γε πρότερον ἡρώων ἦν ὀνόματα καὶ ναυμάχων καὶ νομοθετῶν, νυνὶ δὲ Λουκούλλων τε καὶ Φαβρικίων⁴⁵ καὶ Λευκανίων τῶν μακαρίων. ἐμοὶ μὲν εἴη μᾶλλον ὄνομα Μίμνερμος.

72. Ἑστιαίφ. Ὁ πατὴρ ἡμῶν Ἀπολλώνιος ἦν τρὶς τοῦ Μηνοδότου, σὰ δὲ ἄπαξ ἐθέλεις ὀνομάζεσθαι Λουκρήτιος ἢ Λουπερκός. τίνος σὰ τούτων ἀπόγονος; αἰσχρόν, εἰ ὄνομα μὲν ἔχοις τινός, τὸ δὲ εἶδος αὐτοῦ μὴ ἔχοις.

longer remain Greek, and I shall explain what I mean by "not remaining." There is no wise elder in Athens, for no one at all has a bushy beard, since no one has any beard. The flatterer stands by the gates, the informer in front of their gates, the pimp before the Long Walls, the hanger-on before Munychia and the Piraeus. The goddess does not even dwell in Sounion.⁹⁷

71. To the Ionians: 98 You think that you have the name "Ionians" because of your pedigrees and the emigration of long ago, 99 but Greeks have the shape and look of human beings just as they have their particular customs, laws, language, and way of life. Most of you, however, do not even keep your names, and your recent prosperity has made you lose the marks of your ancestors. Those would not even welcome you in their tombs, since you have become strangers to them. Your names used once to be those of heroes, admirals, and lawgivers, but now are those of a Lucullus, a Fabricius, a Lucanius, the lucky people! For me "Mimnermus" would be a preferable name. 100

72. To Hestiaeus: Our father Apollonius was the son, grandson, and great-grandson of a Menodotus, but you wish simply to be called "Lucretius" or "Lupercus." Which of these are you descended from? It would be disgraceful to have someone's name and yet not to look like them.

city, and Munychia one of its several harbors. Sounion is the cape in southern Attica where Athena might be expected to make her last stand. 98 This complaint of Apollonius against the Ionian League forms the subject of VA~4.5.

⁹⁹ The Ionians were believed to have emigrated from Greece under the leadership of Ion, son of Apollo.

100 Poet probably of the seventh century from Smyrna in Ionia, and so someone with an authentic Ionian name.

 $^{^{43}}$ γένυς Ol.: γυνὴ 44 [καλῶς] del. Cob.

⁴⁵ Φαβρικίων Cob.: Φαυρικίων

⁴⁶ Λουκρήτιος Cichorius: Λουκρίτιος

⁹⁷ Piraeus is the general port area of Athens south west of the

73. τῷ αὐτῷ. Πατρίδος ἐσμὲν πορρωτέρω σὺν δαίμονι, ἤδη δὲ τὰ τῆς πόλεως πράγματα ἐν νῷ ἐβαλλόμην. "ὁδεύει μοῖρα πρὸς τέλος ἀνδρῶν, οἱ τὰν πρώταν λελόγχασι τιμάν." ἄρξει δὲ τὸ λοιπὸν παιδάρια
καὶ μικρὸν ἐπάνω τούτων μείρακες. ἐνταῦθά που δέος,
μὴ σφαλῆ τὰ ὑπὸ νέων κυβερνώμενα. σοὶ δ' οὐ δέος,
ἐπεὶ βεβιώκαμεν.

74. τοῖς Στωϊκοῖς. "Ωρα καὶ λιμὸς ἦν Βάσσφ καίπερ ὅντων τῷ πατρὶ συχνῶν χρημάτων. πρῶτον μὲν οὖν ἔφυγε Μέγαράδε σὺν ἑνὶ τῶν λεγομένων ἐραστῶν, ἄμα δὲ καὶ μαστροπῶν (τροφῆς γὰρ ἀμφοτέροις ἔδει καὶ ἐφοδίων), ἔπειτα ἐκεῖθεν εἰς Συρίαν. ὑπεδέχετο δὲ τὸν ὡραῖον Εὐφράτης, καὶ εἴ τις ὁμοίως ἐδεῖτο τοῦ τότε καλοῦ, ὥστε ἃν αἰρεῖσθαί τι τῶν ἀτόπων δι' εὔνοιαν.

75. τοις ἐν Σάρδεσιν. Ὁ παις ᾿Αλυάττεω σῶσαι τὴν ἐαυτοῦ πόλιν ἀδύνατος ἐγένετο καὶ ἀμήχανος καίπερ ῶν βασιλεύς τε καὶ Κροισος, ὑμεῖς δὲ ποίῳ πεποιθότες ἄρα λέοντι πόλεμον ἄσπονδον ἤρασθε παιδες, νέοι, ἄνδρες, γέροντες, ἀλλὰ καὶ παρθένοι καὶ γυναικες; Ἐρινύων νομίσαι ἄν τις τὴν πόλιν εἶναι, καὶ οὐχὶ Δήμητρος. ἡ δὲ θεὰ φιλάνθρωπος· ὑμιν δὲ τίς οὖτος ὁ χόλος:

75α. Αἰτίαν έχετε τὴν πατρίαν θεὰν σέβειν τε καὶ

LETTERS

73. To the same: I am rather far from my ancestral city, by heaven's will, but I recently began to think about the city's affairs. "Fate travels towards the life's end of the men who have obtained the highest office." Hereafter boys will rule, and soon after them youths. Then no doubt there is a danger that a government of the young may stumble. But you need feel no danger, since we have lived our lives.

74. To the Stoics: Bassus had good looks and starvation, though his father had plenty of money. First, therefore, he fled to Megara along with one of his so-called lovers, simultaneously of his pimps, since the two of them needed food and their fare. After that he went to Syria, where Euphrates gave the pretty boy shelter, and so did anyone who needed him for similar reasons, handsome as he was then. He would have been ready for any perversion to get goodwill.

75. To those in Sardis: The son of Alyattes had no power or means to save his city, though he was king and he was Croesus. But you, what sort of lion¹⁰² are you trusting in so as to enter a war to the death, boys, youths, adults, old men, even young women and wives? One would think that your city was the realm of the Furies, not of Demeter.¹⁰³ The goddess loves mankind, so what is this anger of yours? 75a. To the same: You have a reputation for worshiping

101 Quotation from an unknown lyric poet, David A. Campbell, *Greek Lyric* (LCL) V no. 946 (transl. Campbell).

102 According to Herodotus (1.84), a king of Sardis had been told that the acropolis of the city could not be taken if he carried a lion cub around the walls. He failed to do so in one part, and in Croesus's reign the Persians breached them at this very point.

103 See on Letter 56.

τιμάν, ή δὲ Μήτηρ⁴⁷ ὀνομάζεται παρ' οἶς μὲν θεῶν, παρ' οἶς δὲ καὶ ἀνθρώπων, παρὰ πᾶσι δὲ καὶ καρπῶν· ή δὲ μία κοινή τε καὶ πάντων. εἶτα πῶς μόνων ὑμῶν ἐχθρὰ τὰ γένη νόμῳ τε καὶ φύσει καὶ ἔθει, τῶν Δήμητρος ἰδίων;

76. τοις αὐτοις. Εἰκὸς εἰς πόλιν ἀρχαίαν τε καὶ μεγάλην ἐθελησαι φιλόσοφον ἀρχαιον παραγενέσθαι, καὶ παρεγενόμην ἂν αὐτὸς ἑκὼν κληθηναι μὴ περιμείνας, ὡς ὑφ' ἐτέρων πολλῶν, εἰ ποιήσειν μίαν ὑμῶν τὴν πόλιν ἔμελλον ἤθει καὶ φύσει καὶ νόμω καὶ θεῷ. καὶ τὸ ὅσον ἐπ' ἐμοὶ πάντως ἂν ἐποίησα, στάσις δέ, ὡς ἔφη τις, πολέμου χαλεπώτερον.

77. Φοιτηταίς. Διὰ φιλοσοφίαν εἴρηται τῶν εἰρημένων ἔκαστον, οὐ δι' Εὐφράτην. μὴ τὸ Πραξιτέλους ξίφος ἢ τὸ Λυσίου φάρμακον πεφοβῆσθαί μέ τις δόξη. καὶ τοῦτο γάρ ἐστιν Εὐφράτου.

77a. Σιτοκαπήλοις. ή γη πάντων μήτηρ, δικαία γάρ, ύμεις δὲ ἄδικοι ὅντες πεποίησθε αὐτὴν αὐτῶν μόνων μητέρα, καὶ εἰ μὴ παύσεσθε, οὐκ ἐάσω ὑμᾶς ἐν αὐτῆ⁴⁸ ἑστάναι.

77b. Βασιλεὺς Φραώτης Ἰάρχα διδασκάλφ καὶ τοῖς περὶ αὐτὸν σοφοῖς. Ἀπολλώνιος ἀνὴρ σοφώτατος σοφωτέρους ὑμᾶς ἑαυτοῦ ἡγεῖται καὶ μαθησόμενος ἥκει τὰ ὑμέτερα. πέμπετε οὖν αὐτὸν εἰδότα ὁπόσα ἴστε· ὡς

and honoring your ancestral goddess. Now she is called by some people "Mother of the Gods," by others "Mother of Humanity," and by all "Mother of Crops," 104 but she is one, universal and belonging to all. So how is it that you alone have families that are hostile to law, nature and custom, you who are Demeter's own?

76. To the same: When a city is old and great, an old-fashioned philosopher naturally wishes to visit it. I would gladly have visited it myself, not waiting to be invited as I have been by many other cities, if only I had the prospect of making your city one in behavior, nature, law, and religion. Though I would certainly have done all I could, faction, as somebody said, is more intractable than war. ¹⁰⁵

77. To his pupils: Every word I have spoken has been for philosophy's sake, not for Euphrates's. Let no one suppose that I was cowed by Praxiteles's sword or Lysias's poison. That too comes from Euphrates. ¹⁰⁶

77a. ¹⁰⁷ To the corn merchants: The earth in her justice is the mother of all, but you in your injustice have made her mother to yourselves alone. If you do not stop I will not even let you stand on the earth's face.

77b. ¹⁶⁸ King Phraotes greets his teacher Iarchas and his wise companions. Apollonius, a very wise man, thinks you wiser than himself, and is coming to learn your lore. When he leaves you, make sure he knows all that you do. He will

 $^{^{47}}$ ἡ δὲ Μήτηρ Jon. (ἡ δὴ M. Pen.): ἡ Δημήτηρ 48 ἐν αὐτῆ: ἐπ' αὐτῆς VA 1.15.3

¹⁰⁴ An altar mentioning the cult of Demeter Karpophoros ("Bringer of Crops") was found at Sardis in 1984. And see Letters 67a and 75a.
105 Plato, Laws I 629D.

 $^{^{106}}$ I.e., is one of Euphrates's slanders. For Praxiteles see Letter 36; Lysias is unknown. 107 Also in VA 1.15.3.

¹⁰⁸ Also in VA 2.41.

ἀπολείται οὐδὲν τῶν μαθημάτων ὑμῖν, καὶ γὰρ λέγει ἄριστα ἀνθρώπων καὶ μέμνηται. ἰδέτω δὲ καὶ τὸν θρόνον, ἐφ' οὖ καθίσαντί μοι τὴν βασιλείαν ἔδωκας, Ἰάρχα πάτερ. καὶ οἱ ἐπόμενοι δὲ αὐτῷ ἄξιοι ἐπαίνου, ὅτι τοιοῦδε ἀνδρὸς ἤττηνται.

77c. `Απολλώνιος τοῖς αὐτοῖς. ἀφικομένῳ μοι πεζῆ πρὸς ὑμᾶς δεδώκατε⁴⁹ τὴν θάλατταν, ἀλλὰ καὶ σοφίας τῆς ἐν ὑμῖν κοινωνήσαντες δεδώκατε καὶ διὰ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ πορεύεσθαι. μεμνήσομαι τούτων καὶ πρὸς Ἑλληνας, κοινωνήσω τε λόγων ὡς παροῦσιν <ὑμῖν>,50 εἰ μὴ μάτην ἔπιον τοῦ Ταντάλου.

77d. Μὴ βουληθέντι σοι ἐπ' αἰχμῆ κηρύττεσθαι μηδ' ἐπὶ δηίων⁵¹ αἴματι δίδωμι ἐγὼ τὸν σωφροσύνης στέφανον, ἐπειδὴ ἐφ' οἶς δεῖ στεφανοῦσθαι, γιγνώσκεις.

77e. Δημητρίω κυνὶ. Δίδωμί σε βασιλεῖ Τίτω διδάσκαλον τοῦ τῆς βασιλείας ἤθους, σὺ δ᾽ ἀληθεῦσαί τέ μοι πρὸς αὐτὸν δίδου καὶ γίγνου αὐτῷ, πλὴν ὀργῆς, πάντα.

77f. 'Αὐτοκράτωρ Οὐεσπασιανὸς 'Απολλωνίω φιλοσόφω χαίρειν. εἰ πάντες, 'Απολλώνιε, κατὰ ταὐτά σοι φιλοσοφεῖν ἤθελον, σφόδρα ἂν εὐδαιμόνως ἔπραττε⁵² φιλοσοφία τε καὶ πενία· φιλοσοφία μὲν ἀδεκάστως ἔχουσα, πενία δὲ αὐθαιρέτως.

not forget any of your lessons, since he is the most eloquent of humans and the most retentive. Let him see the throne on which I sat when you gave me my kingdom, father Iarchas. His companions also deserve praise for their devotion to such a Master.

77c. Apollonius to the same: ¹⁰⁹ I came to you by land, and you have given me the sea; but you also shared your special wisdom with me, and showed me a path through heaven. I will recall all this to the Greeks, and enjoy your conversations as if you were present, unless it was for nothing that I drank to Tantalus. ¹¹⁰

77d.¹¹¹ To Titus, the general: Since you did not want to be proclaimed for military prowess or for enemy blood, I give you the crown for modesty, because you know what deeds merit crowning.

77e. 112 To Demetrius the Cynic: I grant you to the emperor Titus so that he may learn the ways of kingship. Grant me the favor of speaking truth to him, and be all in all to him except for your anger.

77f. ¹¹³ The emperor Vespasian greets the philosopher Apollonius. If everyone were willing to be a philosopher of your kind, Apollonius, it would be well both for philosophy and for poverty, since philosophy would be incorruptible and poverty voluntary.

⁴⁹ ἐδώκατε: δεδώκατε VA 3.51

⁵⁰ ⟨ύμῖν⟩ Pen.

⁵¹ δηίων: δηίω VA 6.29.2

⁵² ἔπραττον: ἔπραττε VA 8.7.11

¹⁰⁹ Also in VA 3.51.

¹¹⁰ For the "water of Tantalus," see VA 3.32.2.

¹¹¹ Also in VA 6.29.2.

¹¹² Also in VA 6.33.

¹¹³ Also in VA 8.7.11.

78. γράφων γὰρ τοῖς Βραχμᾶσιν ὅρκον τινὰ ὀμνύει· "οὐ μὰ τὸ Ταντάλιον ὕδωρ, οὖ με ἐμυήσατε."

79. Άπολλώνιος Γλαύκω, καλὸν μάζα καὶ τρίβων, μὴ κατ' ἐπιτήδευμα δοξοκοπικὸν καλλωπιζόμενα, ⁵³ ἀλλ' ὅταν τὰ πράγματα ἄγη πρὸς αὐτά, σεμνῶς φορούμενα.

80. ἀπολλώνιος Ἡρωδιανῷ. μὴ φεῦγε διὰ τοὺς †ἀσημάντους† χρήσιμος εἶναι τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς ἱκανοὶ γὰρ οὖτοι καὶ τὰς ὑπὲρ ἐκείνων χάριτας διδόναι.

81. ἀπολλώνιος Νουμηνίφ. οὐ παρὰ πολλοῖς ἡ χάρις τίκτει χάριν.

82. ἀπολλώνιος Εὐφράτη. Οὐκ ἐπιλογιζομένη ἡ ψυχὴ τὸ τοῦ σώματος αὕταρκες οὐ δύναται ἑαυτὴν αὐτάρκη ποιῆσαι.

83. ἀπολλώνιος Δηλίφ. Ψεύδεσθαι ἀνελεύθερον, ἀλήθεια γενναΐον.

84. ἀπολλώνιος Εἰδομένη. Ἐζηλώσαμεν τὴν αὐτάρκειαν, οὐχ ὅπως τοῖς εὐτελέσι καὶ λιτοῖς πάντως χρώμεθα, ἀλλ' ὅπως θαρρῶμεν πρὸς αὐτά.

85. τοις γνωρίμοις. Μηδέν με δόξητε ἡαδίως ἄλλοις παραινείν αὐτὸς γὰρ ἐπὶ τῆς μαζῆς καὶ τῆς ἄλλης τῆς

78. In writing to the Brahmans he [i.e., Apollonius] swears an oath: "not by the water of Tantalus, into which you inducted me." 114

79. Apollonius to Glaucus: ¹¹⁵ Unleavened bread and a philosopher's cloak are good if not paraded as a habit to attract attention, but when circumstances make them appropriate and they are worn with dignity.

80. Apollonius to Herodianus: Just because of . . . people, do not shrink from being useful to good ones, since these are sufficient to thank you on behalf of the other kind.

81. A pollonius to Numenius: It is not with many people that a favor begets a favor. $^{116}\,$

82. Apollonius to Euphrates: The soul that does not take account of the self-sufficiency of the body cannot make itself self-sufficient.

83. Apollonius to Delius: To lie is base, while truth is noble.

84. Apollonius to Idomeneus: We have practiced selfsufficiency not so that we should always live in cheap and humble circumstances, but so that we might have courage to bear them.

85. Apollonius to his pupils: Do not suppose that I give advice to others lightly. It is because I myself live on un-

3.17.13; 85 = 3.17.14; 86 = 3.20.48; 87 = 3.20.49; 88 = 3.20.50; 89 = 3.23.4; 90 = 3.29.82; 91 = 3.29.83; 92 = 3.33.13; 93 = 3.36.28; 94 = 3.36.29; 95 = 3.38.54; 96 = 4.16.16; 97 = 4.32.9; 98 = 4.53.34; 99 = 4.56.35; 100 = 4.56.37. On these letters and their addressees, see Introduction.

116 Borrowed from the fourth-century comic poet Anaxandridas (fr. 69 Kassel-Austin).

⁵³ καλλωπιζόμενα Wachsmuth: καλούμενα

¹¹⁴ Quoted by the Neoplatonist Porphyry, *de Styge* (Stob. *Anth.* 1.3.56), though this may be a recollection of Letter 77c.

 $^{^{115}}$ All the following letters are known only from the *Anthology* of John Stobaeus (see Introduction), as follows: 79 = 2.15.34; 80 = 2.46.20; 81 = 2.46.21; 82 = 3.10.63; 83 = 3.11.28; 84 =

μανία.

87. ἀπολλώνιος ἀριστοκλεῖ. Τὸ τῆς ὀργῆς πάθος μὴ καθομιλούμενον μηδὲ θεραπευόμενον φυσικὴ νόσος γίνεται.

88. `Απολλώνιος Δημοκράτει. 'Ο ὑπὲρ μικρῶν ἁμαρτημάτων ἀνυπερβλήτως ὀργιζόμενος οὐκ ἐῷ διαγνῶναι τὸν ἁμαρτάνοντα, πότε ἔλαττον καὶ πότε μεῖζον ἡδίκησεν.

89. ἀπολλώνιος Σατύρφ. Οἱ πολλοὶ τῶν ἀνθρώπων τῶν μὲν ἰδίων ἁμαρτημάτων συνήγοροι γίνονται, τῶν δὲ ἀλλοτρίων κατήγοροι.

90. Ἀπολλώνιος Δίωνι. Τὸ μὴ γενέσθαι οὐδέν, τὸ δὲ γενέσθαι πόνος.

91. ἀπολλώνιος Δαναῷ. Οὐ κάμνει τὰ πράγματα πρασσόμενα.

92. ἀπολλώνιος τοῖς γνωρίμοις. Πολλην ἐπιμέλειαν ποιεῖσθε περὶ τοῦ μὴ λέγειν ἃ μὴ δεῖ, παντελῶς γὰρ ἀπαιδεύτου τινός ἐστι τὸ μὴ δύνασθαι σιγεῖν, ἀλλ᾽ ἐκλαλεῖν τὰ μὴ καλῶς ἔχοντα.

93. ἀπολλώνιος τοῖς γνωρίμοις. Πολυλογία πολλὰ σφάλματα ἔχει, τὸ δὲ σιγᾶν ἀσφαλές.

94. ἀπολλώνιος Εὐφράτη. Οἱ κράτιστοι τῶν ἀνθρώπων βραχυλογώτατοι. οἱ οὖν ἀδολέσχαι εἰ ἠνιῶντο, ὡς ἀνιῶσι, οὐκ ἃν ἐμακρηγόρουν.

95. Απολλώνιος τοις άδελφοις. Οὐδενὶ φθονητέον

leavened bread, and in general on a diet that goes with it, that I recommend such things to you.

86. Apollonius to Macedo: Madness is irascibility in full

bloom.

87. Apollonius to Aristocles: The passion of anger, if not tamed and cured, becomes a physical disease.

88. Apollonius to Democrates: One who gets excessively angry over small wrongs prevents the offender from distinguishing his major faults from his minor ones.

89. Apollonius to Satyrus: Most people are defenders of their own faults and prosecutors of other people's.

90. Apollonius to Dio: Not to come into existence is nothing, but existence is pain.

91. Apollonius to Danaus: Actions never tire of being

performed.117

92. Apollonius to his pupils: Take great care not to say what you should not. For it is the absolute mark of an uncultured person not to be unable to stay silent and to blurt out improprieties.

93. Apollonius to the same. Talkativeness causes many a

mistake, but silence is safe.

94. Apollonius to Euphrates. The best people use the fewest words. That is why, if chatterers felt as much annoyance as they cause, they would not make long speeches.

95. Apollonius to his brothers: You should envy no one,

¹¹⁷ Meaning uncertain.

ἀγαθοὶ μὲν γὰρ $\langle \epsilon \dot{v} \pi \rho \alpha \xi \iota \hat{\omega} v \rangle^{54}$ ἄξιοι, κακοὶ δ' ἃν εὐτυχῶσι, κακῶς ζῶσι.

96. ἀπολλώνιος Διονυσίφ. Καλὸν πρὶν παθεῖν διδαχθῆναι πηλίκον ἐστὶν ἡσυχία.

97. 'Απολλώνιος Λύκφ. Οὐ τὸ πένεσθαι κατὰ φύσιν αἰσχρόν, ἀλλὰ τὸ δι' αἰσχρὰν αἰτίαν πένεσθαι ὄνειδος.

98. ἀπολλώνιος Κορνηλιανῷ. Βραχὺς ὁ βίος ἀνθρώπῳ εὖ πράττοντι, δυστυχοῦντι δὲ μακρός.

99. ἀπολλώνιος Νουμηνίω. Οὐ θρηνητέον οἴων φίλων ἐστερήθημεν, ἀλλὰ μνημονευτέον, ὅτι μετὰ τῶν φίλων τὴν καλλίστην βιοτὴν ἐβιοτεύσαμεν.

100. ἀπολλώνιος Θεαιτήτφ. Τὸ λυπούμενον ἀλλοτρίοις κακοῖς παραμυθοῦ.

54 <εὐπραξιῶν> Wachsmuth

LETTERS

for the good are deserving of success, but if the wicked do well, they live badly.

96. Apollonius to Dionysius: Before you suffer, it is good to learn the value of tranquillity.

97. Apollonius to Lycus: Being poor is not inherently shameful: the disgrace is to be poor for a shameful reason.

98. Apollonius to Cornelianus: Life is short for a person with good fortune, long for one in bad fortune.

99. Apollonius to Numenius: We should not mourn for those friends we have lost, but remember that we lived the best of lives with our friends.

100. Apollonius to Theaetetus: Comfort whatever is grieved by the misfortunes of others.